

4 April 2025

Positive preliminary assessment of the satisfactory fulfilment of milestones and targets related to the fourth payment request submitted by France on 21 January 2025, transmitted to the Economic and Financial Committee by the European Commission

Executive summary

In accordance with Article 24(2) of Regulation (EU) 2021/241, on 21 January 2025, France submitted a request for payment for the fourth instalment of the non-repayable support. The payment request was accompanied by the required management declaration and summary of audits.

To support its payment request, France provided due justification of the satisfactory fulfilment of the 17 milestones and targets of the fourth instalment of the non-repayable support, as set out in Section 2(1) (1.4) of the Council Implementing Decision of 14 July 2023 on the approval of the assessment of the recovery and resilience plan for France¹.

For four targets and two milestones covering a large number of recipients, in addition to the summary documents and official listings provided by France, Commission services have assessed a statistically significant sample of individual files. The sample size has been uniformly set at 60, which corresponds to a confidence level of 95% in all cases.

In its payment request, France has confirmed that measures related to previously satisfactorily fulfilled milestones and targets have not been reversed. The Commission does not have evidence of the contrary. Upon receipt of the payment request, the Commission has assessed on a preliminary basis the satisfactory fulfilment of the relevant milestones and targets. Based on the information provided by France, the Commission has made a positive preliminary assessment of the satisfactory fulfilment of all 17 milestones and targets.

The milestones and targets positively assessed as part of this payment request demonstrate significant steps in the implementation of France's Recovery and Resilience Plan. They notably highlight the continuation of the reform momentum in key policy areas. This includes, among others, the completion of regulatory studies by 24 agglomerations aiming at creating low greenhouse gas emission zones, as foreseen by the Climate and Resilience Law, and the assessment of measures taken to improve the quality of public spending implemented in the 2023 budgetary law stemming from spending reviews. The milestones and targets also confirm progress towards the completion of investment projects related to a number of areas including energy renovation of public buildings, daily mobility and acceleration of transport infrastructure works, digitalisation of businesses, State and schools, and the catching up on technical standards for digital.

By the transmission of this positive preliminary assessment and in accordance with Article 24(4) of Regulation (EU) 2021/241, the Commission asks for the opinion of the Economic and Financial Committee on the satisfactory fulfilment of the relevant milestones and targets.

¹ ST 11150/2023 INIT; ST - 11150/2023 ADD 1 REV 2, published.

Contents

Number and name of the Target: T1-11, Number of m ² of floors of public sites belonging to the State where the energy renovation works have been completed.....	3
Number and name of the Target: T 1-12, Number of schools, colleges or high schools where the energy renovation works have been completed.	8
Number and name of the Target: 2-2, Law Climate & Resilience – low GHG emission zones.	11
Number and name of the Target: 3-19 Public transport reserved lanes.....	18
Number and name of the Target: 3-25 Projects realised on waterways.....	25
Number and name of the Milestone: 3-26 Modernisation of the CROSS network and numerical system for the maritime affairs	28
Number and name of the Milestone: 6-7 Awards of contracts – implementing decision of the Prime Minister.....	31
Number and name of the Milestone: 6-9 Awards of contracts – implementing decision of the Prime Minister.....	37
Number and name of the Milestone: 6-12 Investments in Ariane 6.....	42
Number and name of the Milestone: 7-14 Annual assessment of measures taken to improve the quality of public spending implemented in the 2023 budgetary law	45
Number and name of the Milestone: 7-19 Investment to increase governmental cybersecurity.....	48
Number and name of the Milestone: 7-27 Number of students having access to digital training	52
Number and name of the Milestone: 7-31 Schemes to support art creation.	60
Number and name of the Target: 9-4 State digital infrastructure in the field of health.....	65
Number and name of the Target: 9-5 Finalisation of interoperability and security of installed fleet software and support and incentives for its use	73
Number and name of the Target: 9-6 Digital catch-up of the social medicine	80
Number and name of the Target: 9-8 Number of investment projects in the construction, energy renovation or modernization of medical establishments (> € 20 million) (cumulative)	84

Number and name of the Target: T1-11, Number of m² of floors of public sites belonging to the State where the energy renovation works have been completed

Related Measure: C1.I3, Thermal renovation of public buildings

Quantitative Indicator: Number of square meters (in million)

Baseline: 20

Target: 28.75

Time: Q4 2024

1. Context:

The measure aims to support energy renovation of buildings belonging to the State or its operators and of buildings belonging to local and regional authorities. For buildings belonging to the State or its operators, such projects are selected through two calls for projects launched in autumn 2020: the first one concerns higher education and research buildings and universities, and the second one concerns all other buildings, managed by the DIE (*Direction de l'Immobilier de l'Etat*).

Target 1-11 concerns the number of square meters (28.75 million) of public sites buildings belonging to the State or its operators where energy renovation works have been completed, with an objective to achieve at least 30% of energy savings on average.

Target 1-11 is the fourth and last target of the investment (together with target 1-12 of this payment request), and it follows the completion of target 1-8 related to the notification of energy renovation works in public buildings belonging to the State or its operators, target 1-9 related to the notification of energy renovation works in public buildings belonging to local and regional authorities, and target 1-10 related to the completion of energy renovation works in public buildings belonging to the State or its operators (lower number of square meters covered by energy renovation works).

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence	Short description
1	T1-11 Summary document '1-11 Rénovation énergétique bâtiments publics_SD_v3.pdf'	A summary document duly justifying how the target was satisfactorily fulfilled in line with the requirements set out in the Council Implementing Decision Annex.
2	List of projects completed '1-11_liste projets 4eme DP_v3.xls'	An Excel file including the list of projects selected by the two calls for projects on energy renovation of public buildings belonging to the State, extracted from the Information System of the DIE (<i>Direction de l'Immobilier de l'Etat</i>), called 'Infocentre immobilier de l'Etat' specifying among others:

		<p>a. the identifying number of the project (column A): FR XXXX (with 4 different numbers)</p> <p>b. the location of the project (columns B to D)</p> <p>c. the recipient of the project (columns E and F)</p> <p>d. the call for project concerned (column G)</p> <p>e. the date of completion of works (column H)</p> <p>f. the amount of energy renovation works (columns I and J)</p> <p>g. the unique reference number of the public site in the data base of the DIE called 'Chorus Re' (column K)</p> <p>h. the surface of the site, in square meters (column L).</p>
3	<p>Two calls for projects</p> <p><i>'AAP Plan de relance - Rénovation thermique Etat – ESR 2.pdf'</i></p> <p><i>'APP Plan de relance - Rénovation thermique Etat hors ESR 2.pdf'</i></p>	The two calls for projects that have been used to select the final recipients (one concerning higher education and research buildings and universities (ESR 2), and one concerning all other buildings belonging to the State or its operators (hors ESR 2)).
4	<p>List of laureates of the two calls for projects</p> <p><i>'20201214_Projets lauréats_.xlsx'</i></p>	<p>An Excel file listing all the projects selected by the two calls for projects that have been used to select the final recipients, extracted from the 'Infocentre immobilier de l'Etat' database, specifying among others:</p> <p>a. the identifying number of the project (column A)</p> <p>b. the recipient of the project (columns B and C)</p> <p>c. the location of the project (columns D, E and F)</p> <p>d. the energy renovation works planned at the moment of the selection of the project (column G)</p> <p>In addition to the Excel file, the publicly available link to the laureates (here) has been provided in the Summary document.</p>
5	<p>71 screenshots of the Infocentre database</p> <p><i>'2025-02-12...._SUB.png'</i></p>	71 screenshots of the 'Infocentre immobilier de l'Etat' database which is an inventory of the public sites belonging to the State, enabling to relate the Chorus number of the 60 sites of the sampling with their surface area.
6	<p>List of buildings of the sampling</p> <p><i>'Export_OAD_12022025_SUB_sites_echantillon.xls'</i></p>	An Excel file extracted from the Information System of the DIE, linking the Chorus number of the 60 sites of the sampling to their surface area.
7	<p>3 screenshots of the Infocentre database</p> <p><i>'2025-02-13..._Propriete.png'</i></p>	3 screenshots of the 'Infocentre immobilier de l'Etat' database which is an inventory of the sites belonging to the State, enabling to relate the Chorus number of the 60 sites of the sampling with the ownership and occupational status of these sites.

8	Evidence demonstrating the completion of the energy renovation works	For a sample of 60 public sites, one or more documents demonstrating the completion of energy renovation works ('attestation de fin de travaux' provided by the State service; 'procès verbal de réception de travaux', extract from the State service database concerning the follow-up of works; invoices, etc.).
9	Décret n° 2019-771 du 23 juillet 2019 relatif aux obligations d'actions de réduction de la consommation d'énergie finale dans des bâtiments à usage tertiaire https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/jorf/id/JORFARTI000038812270	Decree No 2019-771 of 23 July 2019 laying down requirements for tertiary buildings to reduce their final energy consumption

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the target.

Number of m² of floors of public sites belonging to the State where energy renovation has been completed by the end of 2024.

The French authorities provided an Excel list of projects of public buildings extracted from the Information System of the Department of National Real Estate (DIE, *Direction de l'Immobilier de l'Etat*), which is a Directorate of the Ministry of Economy, Finance and Industrial and Digital Sovereignty (evidence 2). All the buildings concerned by those projects belong either to a Ministry (column E of evidence 2) or to a specific public operator under the jurisdiction of a Ministry (column F of evidence 2).

Following the selection of a random sample of 60 units, France submitted three screenshots of the 'Infocentre immobilier de l'Etat' database, which is an inventory of the sites belonging to the State (evidence 7). The evidence provided for a sample of 60 units confirmed that they all belong to the list of beneficiaries assessed under target 1-8 for the first payment request (i.e. selected on the basis of the two calls for proposals for the renovation of buildings belonging to the State), and that the building is:

- a public site belonging to the State (for 48 units); or
- a public site belonging to a public operator placed under the supervision of one or two Ministries (for four units: FR 1158 belongs to the National Center for Forest Property (*Centre national de la propriété forestière - CNPF*) under the Ministry of Agriculture; FR 1882 and FR 8009 belong to the Adult Vocational Training Agency (*Agence pour la formation professionnelle des adultes – AFPA*) under the joint supervision of Ministry of Labour and Employment and Ministry of Budget; and FR 4856 belongs to the National Research Institute for agriculture, food and the environment (*Institut national de recherche pour l'agriculture, l'alimentation et l'environnement - INRAE*) under the joint supervision of Ministry of Research and Ministry of Agriculture); or
- a public site under the control of the State: For eight units (FR 0055, FR 1717, FR 2497, FR 2509, FR 3964, FR 5998, FR 6594, FR 8911), the State services occupy the site, with the same rights and duties as an owner, including those related to energy renovation works. These

buildings (e.g. 'préfectures', that is administration services under the supervision of the Ministry of Interior) are part of the inventory of the Department of National Real Estate (DIE, *Direction de l'Immobilier de l'Etat*).

This confirms that the requirement of the target that buildings belong to the State, or its operator has been met.

The Excel list of projects indicates the square meters of floors of the public sites that have undergone energy renovation works (column L of evidence 2). The total of square meters reported in column L amount to 30.596 million square meters, exceeding the target of 28.75 million square meters.

Following the selection of a random sample of 60 units, France submitted 71 screenshots of the 'Infocentre immobilier de l'Etat' data base enabling to relate the Chorus number of the 60 sites with their surface area (evidence 5) and an Excel file extracted from this database (evidence 6) to facilitate the calculation on the surface areas (evidence 6). The evidence provided for a sample of 60 units confirmed that, for each Chorus number corresponding to a unique reference number for one site, the number of square meters reported in the list of projects (evidence 2) matches the number of square meters of the Excel file extracted from the Information System of the DIE (evidence 6), as well as the number of square meters indicated in the screenshots of the 'Infocentre' database (evidence 5). This confirms that the requirement of the target on the number of square meters has been met.

The Excel list of recipients demonstrates that all projects have been completed before the end of 2024 (evidence 2, column H). The exact end dates reported in column H indicate that, out of 1992 projects, 810 were completed in 2021, 775 in 2022, 355 in 2023 and 52 in 2024.

Following the selection of a random sample of 60 units, France submitted several documents such as certificates of completion of works signed by the project manager and the project owner, final invoices for energy renovation works, or screenshots of the State service database concerning the follow-up of works (evidence 8).

The evidence provided for a sample of 60 units show that for 56 units, energy renovation works correspond to the description of works indicated in the Excel list of laureates (evidence 4, column G) and that those energy renovation works were completed before the end of 2024 (evidence 8).

For two units (FR 3341 and FR 4856), the project concerned the construction of a new building, to replace an existing building, for reasons of energy performance: it was not possible to renovate them effectively due to their dilapidated state. This was in line with the two calls for projects concerning energy renovation of public buildings (evidence 3) which stipulated that 'as an exception, partial or total demolition/reconstruction operations may be taken into account on a case-by-case basis'. Furthermore, additional evidence provided for these two projects show very high energy performance: 65% of energy savings for the first one (FR 3341) in comparison to the old building, and energy neutrality for the second one (FR 4856) (evidence 8 for these two samples). For these two units, the construction works were completed before the end of 2024 (evidence 8).

For one unit (FR 1153), the evidence on the completion of works demonstrates that the works were completed in October 2021 (evidence 8, 'décision de réception des travaux' – EXE 6), but the lifting of reservations occurred in February 2025 (evidence 8, 'réception des travaux' EXE 9).

For one unit (FR 2895), the evidence demonstrates that the energy renovation works were completed before the end of 2024 (evidence 8, EXE 6 for lots 1a, 1b, 2, 3, 4, 6, 7 and 8), except for one lot (lot 5 related to carpentry works) for which the reservations were lifted on 7 March 2025 (evidence 8, 'réception des travaux - procès verbal de levée des réserves' EXE 8).

Whilst this constitutes a minimal substantive deviation from the requirement of the Council Implementing Decision, the energy renovation works were completed at the time of the assessment for these two samples (FR 1153 and FR 2895).

This confirms that the requirement of the target on the completion of energy renovation works has been met.

With the objective of achieving at least 30% of energy savings on average.

The objective of achieving 30% energy savings on average is an ex-ante objective, i.e. to be achieved at the time of project selection. The analysis of target 1-8, which concerned the selection of 2 900 projects during the first payment request, demonstrated that the selection process enabled selecting projects for which the expected energy gains were, on average, 30%.

The 1992 completed projects under target 1-11, corresponding to the 28.75 million of renovated square meters now being assessed, were selected through the same two calls for projects as target 1-8 (evidence 3 for the calls, and evidence 4 for the list of laureates). The evidence provided for a sample of 60 units show that all projects were selected by the same two calls for projects as target 1-8 (evidence 4).

Therefore, it can be considered that the selection process effectively identified projects where the planned energy gains from thermal renovation works were at least 30% on average. This objective is thus deemed achieved for this target, as it was satisfactorily fulfilled for target 1-10.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the renovation works of public buildings have to comply with the decree adopted in application of article 175 of the ELAN Law, which imposes a reduction in energy consumption by 40% by 2030 (compared to 2010) to tertiary buildings.**

The two calls for projects were launched ‘to reduce the energy footprint of public buildings, in accordance with the provisions of the Decree No. 2019-771 of 23 July 2019 related to obligations of actions to reduce energy consumption in tertiary buildings [*Décret n° 2019-771 du 23 juillet 2019 relatif aux obligations d'actions de réduction de la consommation d'énergie finale dans des bâtiments à usage tertiaire*] (hereinafter referred to as “Decree”) adopted under Article 175 of the Law No. 2018-1021 of 23 November 2018 related to the development of housing, planning and digital technology (hereinafter referred to as “ELAN Law”)’ (evidence 3, first paragraph of the two calls). The two calls for projects also refer to the obligations deriving from the ELAN Law: ‘this obligation is also accompanied by two intermediate objectives in 2030 and 2040 where [energy] consumptions must be reduced by 40% and 50% respectively compared to 2010’ (evidence 3, second paragraph). The explicit reference to the obligations deriving from the Decree adopted under Article 175 of the ELAN Law in the calls for projects confirms that this requirement is met.

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment:

Satisfactorily fulfilled.

Number and name of the Target: T 1-12, Number of schools, colleges or high schools where the energy renovation works have been completed.

Related Measure: C1.I3, Thermal renovation of public buildings.

Quantitative Indicator: Number

Baseline: 0

Target: 681

Time: Q4 2024

1. Context:

The measure aims to support energy renovation of buildings belonging to the State and of buildings belonging to local and regional authorities. For the latter, buildings owned or operated by regional authorities (mainly high schools), 'credit delegations' were allocated by the State, and the regions were in charge of project selection. And for buildings (mainly schools and primary colleges) belonging to infra-regional authorities (e.g. municipalities, grouping of municipalities and other local authorities such as 'départements'), investment grants were allocated by the State.

Target 1-12 concerns the completion of energy renovation works for at least 681 schools, colleges or high schools, with an objective of achieving at least 30% of energy savings on average.

Target 1-12 is the fifth and last target of the investment (together with target 1-11 of this payment request) and it follows the completion of target 1-8 related to the notification of energy renovation works in public buildings belonging to the State, target 1-9 related to the notification of energy renovation works in public buildings belonging to local and regional authorities, and targets 1-10 and 1-11 related to the completion of renovation works in public buildings belonging to the State.

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence.	Short description
1	Summary Document '1-12_Summary document_VDEF'	A summary document duly justifying how the target was satisfactorily fulfilled in line with the requirements set out in the Council Implementing Decision Annex.
2	List of projects '1-12_Liste des bénéficiaires_REVISEE_1022025.xlsx'	An Excel file including the list of schools, colleges or high schools for which projects for energy renovation works have been completed (920 records) extracted from the System Information of the General Directorate of Local Authorities (<i>Direction Générale des Collectivités Locales</i> , DGCL hereinafter), specifying among others: a. the unique reference number of the project ('numéro d'ordre') b. the location of the project (columns C to F) c. the type of buildings (school, college or high school), (column G)

		d. the description of the project, with the name of the school (column H) e. the date of the grant notification (column J) f. the date of completion of works (column K).
3	Instruction dated 18 November 2020 related to the support for the energy renovation of local and regional authorities' buildings 'PJ3_1-12_Instruction du 18 novembre 2020_rénovation énergétique des bâtiments des collectivités territoriales.pdf'	This document sets out the objectives, operational priorities and criteria to be considered when allocating allocations to support the energy renovation of local and regional authorities' buildings under the NRRP.
4	Evidence demonstrating the completion of the renovation of works.	For a sample of 60 schools, colleges or high schools, one or more documents demonstrating the completion of energy renovation works: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. legal commitments of the grant allocated for these works ii. service contracts, service and / or purchase orders iii. certificate of completion of the works.
5	Decree No 2019-771 of 23 July 2019 laying down requirements for tertiary buildings to reduce their final energy consumption	Copy of the Decree accessible under the following link: Décret n° 2019-771 du 23 juillet 2019 relatif aux obligations d'actions de réduction de la consommation d'énergie finale dans des bâtiments à usage tertiaire - Légifrance

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the target.

Number of schools, colleges or high schools where the energy renovation works have been completed,

The French authorities provided an Excel list of beneficiaries extracted from the Information System of the General Directorate of Local Authorities (evidence 2), which includes 920 schools, colleges or high schools that have undergone energy renovation works, exceeding the target of 681.

Following the selection of a random sample of 60 units, France submitted for these 60 samples supporting documents related to legal commitments of the grant allocated for the energy renovation works, service contracts, service and / or purchase orders and certificate of completion of the works (evidence 4). The evidence provided for sample of 60 units confirmed that the requirement of the target for each granted project concerns the school, college or high school for which it was selected has been met (columns G and H of evidence 2).

The Excel list of beneficiaries demonstrates that all projects have been completed before the end of 2024 (column L of evidence 2). The end dates reported in column L indicate that 920 schools, colleges and high schools completed their energy renovation works.

In addition to the above verification, following the selection of a random sample of 60 units, France submitted the grant agreements, or the financing decisions allocated for these renovation works, the legal commitments related to the public orders of the works and the certificate of completion of works (evidence 4). The evidence provided for a sample of 59 units, confirmed that the requirements of the target were met. For each institution benefited from the grant contribution for the projects selected under the target 1-9, the works ordered were in line with the type of works for which the funding has been granted and that these works were carried out and completed by the end of 2024. A statistical analysis was carried out taking into account the overachievement of the target of 920 for a required 681. Based on this, there is statistical assurance that the target has been met, and all its constitutive elements have been satisfactorily fulfilled.

With an objective to achieve at least 30% of energy savings on average.

The objective of achieving 30% energy savings on average is an ex-ante objective, i.e. to be achieved at the time of project selection. The analysis of target 1-9, which concerned the selection of 1953 energy renovation projects during the second payment request, demonstrated that the selection process enabled selecting projects for which the expected energy gains were, on average, 30%.

The projects concerned by the educational institutions assessed under target 1-12 are included in the list of beneficiaries of target 1-9 identifying 1953 energy renovation projects corresponding to 2334 public buildings owned by local authorities.

Therefore, it can be considered that the selection process effectively identified projects where the planned energy from thermal renovation works were at least 30% on average. This objective is thus deemed as achieved for this target.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the renovation works of the above-mentioned educational institutions have to comply with the decree adopted in application of article 175 of the ELAN Law, which imposes a reduction in energy consumption by 40% by 2030 (compared to 2010) to tertiary buildings.** In this respect, the financial support to the energy renovation of the local and regional buildings was launched 'to reduce the energy footprint of public buildings, in accordance with the provisions of the Decree n° 2019-771 of 23 July 2019 [*Décret n° 2019-771 du 23 juillet 2019 relatif aux obligations d'actions de réduction de la consommation d'énergie finale dans des bâtiments à usage tertiaire*] (hereinafter referred to as "Decree") adopted under article 175 of the Law n° 2018-1021 of 23 November 2018 related to the development of housing, planning and digital technology (hereinafter referred to as "Loi ELAN")'. The Instruction document dedicated for this support (evidence 3) also refer to the obligations deriving from the ELAN Law: these local and regional energy renovation investments fall within 'the ELAN law obligation with the objectives to reduce by 40% energy consumptions in 2030 and by 50% in 2040 (...) compared to 2010 (...)'. The explicit reference to the obligations deriving from the Decree adopted under article 175 of the ELAN Law in the above-mentioned instruction document confirms this requirement is met.

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment: Satisfactorily fulfilled

Number and name of the Target: 2-2, Law Climate & Resilience – low GHG emission zones.

Related Measure: C2.R1, Law Climate & Resilience.

Quantitative Indicator: Number

Baseline: 0

Target: 18

Time: Q3 2024

1. Context:

The objective of reform C2.R1 'Climate & Resilience Law' is to contribute to the GHG emissions reduction target for 2030, by providing climate and environmental measures based on proposals made by the Citizens' Climate Convention. The Law covers the entire scope of the economy (consuming, producing and working, moving, living, feeding and strengthening the judicial protection of the environment).

Target 2-2 concerns the completion by 18 agglomerations of the regulatory study aiming at creating low GHG emission zones.

Target 2-2 is the second and last target of reform C2.R1 and it follows the completion of milestone 2-1 concerning the promulgation of the Law and the entry into force of those provisions of direct applicability.

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence	Short description
1	T2-2 summary document '2-2 Loi Climat Résilience ZFE_SD'	A summary document duly justifying how the target was satisfactorily fulfilled in line with the requirements set out in the Council Implementing Decision Annex.
2	List of LEZ projects '01_Liste des projets - cible 2-2_ZFE'	A list of the agglomerations having completed the regulatory study aiming at creating low GHG emission zones (hereinafter referred to as 'LEZs') including: the agglomeration name, the region, the date of drafting of the study, and the link to access the public consultation where the study has been published for 22 out of the 24 agglomerations.
3	Regulatory study of Bordeaux '02_Bordeaux_etude_reglementaire_ZFE'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Bordeaux.

4	Regulatory study of Annecy '03_Annecy_etude_reglementaire_ZFE'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Annecy.
5	Regulatory study of Grenoble '04_Grenoble_etude_reglementaire_ZFE'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Grenoble.
6	Regulatory study of Lyon '05_Lyon_etude_reglementaire_ZFE'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Lyon.
7	Regulatory study of Saint-Etienne '06_Saint-Etienne_etude_reglementaire_ZFE'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Saint-Etienne.
8	Regulatory study of Nancy '07_Nancy_etude_reglementaire_ZFE'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Nancy.
9	Regulatory study of Strasbourg '08_Strasbourg_etude_reglementaire_ZFE'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Strasbourg.
10	Regulatory study of Caen '10_Caen_etude_reglementaire_ZFE'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Caen.
11	Regulatory study of Montpellier '11_Montpellier_etude_reglementaire_ZFE'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Montpellier.
12	Regulatory study of Nantes '12_Nantes_etude_reglementaire_ZFE'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Nantes.
13	Regulatory study of Le Havre '13_Le Havre_etude_reglementaire'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Le Havre.
14	Regulatory study of Annemasse '14_Annemasse_etude_reglementaire'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Annemasse.
15	Regulatory study of Bayonne '15_Bayonne_etude_reglementaire'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Bayonne.
16	Regulatory study of Clermont-Ferrand '16_Clermont-Ferrand_etude_reglementaire'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Clermont-Ferrand.
17	Regulatory study of Dijon '17_Dijon_etude_reglementaire_V2'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Dijon.
18	Regulatory study of Rennes '18_Rennes_etude_reglementaire'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Rennes.
19	Regulatory study of Pau '19_Pau_etude_reglementaire'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Pau.

20	Regulatory study of Nîmes '20_Nîmes_etude_reglementaire'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Nîmes.
21	Regulatory study of Angers '21_Angers_etude_reglementaire'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the agglomeration of Angers.
22	Regulatory study of Brest '22_Brest_etude_reglementaire'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the city of Brest.
23	Regulatory study of Chambéry '23_Chambéry_etude_reglementaire'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the city of Chambéry.
24	Regulatory study of Lille '24_Lille_etude_reglementaire'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the city of Lille.
25	Regulatory study of Mulhouse '25_Mulhouse_etude_reglementaire'	A copy of the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the city of Mulhouse.
26	09_1_Éléments_contexte_ZFE_CritAir3	A copy of part 1 the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the city of Paris.
27	09_2_Parc_de_véhicules_impactés_ZFE_CritAir3	A copy of part 2 the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the city of Paris.
28	09_3_Qualité_air_impacts_attendus_ZFE_CritAir3	A copy of part 3 the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the city of Paris.
29	09_4_Synthèse_globale_impacts_attendus_ZFE_CritAir3	A copy of part 4 the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the city of Paris.
30	09_5_Evaluation_a_posteriori_impact_qualité_air_ZFE_étape_CritAir4	A copy of part 5 the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the city of Paris.
31	09_6_Evaluation_prospective_impact_qualité_air_ZFE_CritAir3	A copy of part 6 the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the city of Paris.
32	09_7_Evaluation_socio_economique_ZFE_CritAir3	A copy of part 7 the regulatory study aiming at creating a low GHG emission zone for the city of Paris.
33	Order No. TRER2137357A of 22 December 2021 establishing the lists of agglomerations with more than 100 000, 150 000 and 250 000 inhabitants in accordance with article R.221-2 of the Environment Code and article L.2213-4-1 of the General Local Authorities Code (JORF No. 0302 of 29 December 2021) '26_arrêté du 22 décembre 2021'	A copy of the order demonstrating the population size of the agglomerations 'Arrêté du 22 décembre 2021 établissant les listes d'agglomérations de plus de 100 000, 150 000 et 250 000 habitants conformément à l'article R. 221-2 du code de l'environnement et à l'article L. 2213-4-1 du code général des collectivités territoriales'

		(hereinafter referred to as 'Order of 22 December 2021 establishing population size').
34	Law No. 2021-1104 promulgated on 22 August 2021, related to the fight against climate change and strengthening resilience to its effect (hereinafter referred to as the 'Climate & Resilience Law') (JORF No. 0196 of 24 August 2021)	Law No. 2021-1104 promulgated on 22 August 2021, related to the fight against climate change and strengthening resilience to its effect (hereinafter referred to as the 'Climate & Resilience Law') (Link: JORF No. 0196 of 24 August 2021).
35	Article L.2213-4-1 of the General Local Authorities Code, modified by Art. 119 of Law No. 2021-1104 of 22 August 2021, in force as of 25 August 2021	The publicly available 'Article L.2213-4-1 of the General Local Authorities Code' ('Article L. 2213-4-1 du code général des collectivités territoriales') concerns the creation of low GHG emissions zones and was modified on 22 August 2021 by the Climate and Resilience Law to include new, stricter obligations. (hereinafter referred to as the 'General Local Authorities Code' modified by 'Climate & Resilience Law') Link: https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/article_lc/LEGIARTI000043976834
36	Report on the public consultation for the LEZ of Angers 'Bilan de la concertation' (Angers)	Report on the public consultation for the LEZ of Angers published on by the Angers Loire city urban committee on the official website of the LEZ.
37	Publicly available link to the public consultation for the LEZ of Brest	Webpage to access the public consultation for the LEZ of Brest where the regulatory study was made available on 12 February 2025. Link: https://jeparticipe.brest.fr/project/zone-a-faibles-emissions/step/etape-personnalisee

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the target.

Completion by 18 agglomerations of the regulatory study aiming at creating low GHG emission zones.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, in 2024, it is expected that 18 agglomerations with more than 150 000 inhabitants, have completed the regulatory study aiming at creating low GHG emissions zones

The evidence provided by the French authorities confirmed that prior to the preliminary assessment of this payment request, 24 agglomerations, with more than 150 000 inhabitants, had completed the regulatory studies aiming at creating low GHG emissions zones (hereinafter referred to as 'LEZ'). This evidence includes at least one completed regulatory study per agglomeration aiming at creating LEZs (evidence 3 to 32), the Order of 22 December 2021 establishing population size (evidence 33), and the General Local Authorities Code concerning the creation of LEZs and modified by the Climate and Resilience Law to include new, stricter obligations (evidence 35).

In line with Article L.2213-4-1 of the General Local Authorities Code (paragraph III of evidence 35), the regulatory studies concerning the setting up of a LEZ must include the presentation of the restriction measures, explaining why they are necessary and detailing the environmental and health benefits – most notably in terms of air quality and the reduction in the populations exposure to atmospheric pollutants – as well as the socio-economic impacts on the urban area. The evidence provided by the French authorities as regulatory studies for the 24 agglomerations (evidence 3 to 32) included for each agglomeration all of the aforementioned elements as outlined in Article L.2213-4-1 of the General Local Authorities Code.

In accordance with the modifications brought to the General Local Authorities Code by the Climate and Resilience Law, agglomerations are required to create a new LEZ where none existed prior, or to create a new, stricter LEZ. Most notably, it sets the three following obligations:

- i) Creation of a LEZ in all agglomerations of more than 150 000 inhabitants in metropolitan France by 31 December 2024 (paragraph I of evidence 35).
- ii) Creation of a LEZ in accordance with the specified calendar for traffic restrictions based on the type of vehicle and its level of pollution for agglomerations regularly surpassing the regulatory threshold for air quality (at the time of the study). In particular, setting up restrictions on light vehicles with the label Crit'air 5 by 1st January 2023, with Crit'air 4 by 1st January 2024, with Crit'air 4 by 1st January 2025 (paragraph VI of evidence 35).
- iii) Creation of a LEZ which covers a minimum area, namely 50% of the resident population of the most populated municipal grouping (the *établissement public de coopération intercommunale* 'EPCI') within the agglomeration (paragraph I of evidence 35).

The regulatory studies of the 24 agglomerations provided by the French authorities aim at creating LEZs in accordance with the Climate and Resilience Law as follows:

- 17 agglomerations provided a regulatory study for the creation of a new LEZ in accordance with the Climate and Resilience Law to abide by the aforementioned obligation i). These include Angers, Annecy, Annemasse, Bayonne, Bordeaux, Brest, Caen, Chambéry, Dijon, Le Havre, Lille, Mulhouse, Nancy, Nantes, Nîmes, Pau, and Rennes.
- Three agglomerations provided a regulatory study for the creation of a new LEZ in accordance with the Climate and Resilience Law to abide by the aforementioned obligation ii). These include Grenoble, Montpellier and Strasbourg.
- Two agglomerations provided a regulatory study for the creation of a new stricter LEZ in accordance with the Climate and Resilience Law to abide by the aforementioned obligation ii). These include Lyon and Paris.

- Two agglomerations provided a regulatory study for the creation of a new stricter LEZ in accordance with the Climate and Resilience Law to abide by the aforementioned obligation III. These include Clermont-Ferrand and Saint-Etienne.

The regulatory studies are publicly accessible during the public consultations carried out concerning the implementation of the LEZs. The French authorities provided links for 22 agglomerations that had already launched the consultation (evidence 2) by the time of the payment request submission, with only Brest and Mulhouse not publicly accessible yet. In addition, the French authorities provided a copy of all the regulatory studies (evidence 3 to 32) which demonstrated that the regulatory studies had been completed by the payment request: June 2024 for Bordeaux (page 1 of evidence 3), April 2024 for Annecy (page 1 of evidence 4), April-May 2023 for Grenoble (page 1 of evidence 5), August 2023 for Lyon (page 1 of evidence 6), May 2024 for Saint-Etienne (page 1 of evidence 7), June 2024 for Nancy (page 1 of evidence 8), 23 July 2024 for Caen (page 1 of evidence 10), January 2022 for Montpellier (page 1 of evidence. 11), 26 September 2024 for Le Havre (page 1 of evidence 13), September 2024 for Annemasse (page 1 of evidence 14), 29 August 2024 for Bayonne (page 1 of evidence 15), 27 September 2024 for Dijon (page 1 of evidence 17), 14 October 2024 for Pau (page 2 onwards of evidence 19), September 2024 for Nimes (page 1 of evidence 20), December 2024 for Chambéry (page 1 of evidence 23), and the regulatory study for Clermont-Ferrand provided for a consultation between 7 and 28 October 2024 (page 23 of evidence 16). The official website for the public consultations, which were accessible during the assessment period, on the LEZs for Paris, Strasbourg, Nantes and Brest indicated that the public consultations were carried out between 19 September and 14 October 2024, 18 October and 10 November 2021, 3 June and 1 July 2024, and 12 February and 7 March 2025 respectively (links under evidence 2 and evidence 37) At the time of assessment, the report on the public consultation for the LEZ of Angers, published on the website, indicated that the consultation was carried out between 25 November and 18 December 2024 (page 8 of evidence 36 and link under evidence 2). On this basis, the evidence provided by the French authorities confirmed that the regulatory studies for at least 18 agglomerations were completed in 2024, more specifically 20 were completed in 2024, two were completed in 2023, one in 2022 and one study was published on 12 February 2025, together with the public consultation, confirming it had been completed by the time of the preliminary assessment of this payment request.

Furthermore, Order of 22 December 2021 establishing population size confirms that all 24 agglomerations have more than 150 000 inhabitants (Annex I and Annex II of evidence 33).

thus, improving air quality in cities and contributing to the GHG emissions reduction.

The evidence provided by the French authorities confirmed that the completed regulatory studies aim at creating LEZs in accordance with the Climate and Resilience Law, thus improving air quality in cities and contributing to the greenhouse gas emissions reduction. The first sentence of paragraph I of Article L.2213-4-1 of the General Local Authorities Code of 25 August 2021 determines that the creation of a LEZ is a way to combat air pollution '*I. – Pour lutter contre la pollution atmosphérique, des zones à faibles émissions mobilité peuvent être créées dans les agglomérations [...]*' (evidence 35), demonstrating that the French authorities set up LEZs as a means to improve air quality. Paragraph II, establishes, among others, that i) LEZs are defined by an order setting out the applicable traffic restrictions, ii) the measures set by the aforementioned order are consistent with the emission reduction targets set by the atmospheric protection plan defined in the Environment Code (evidence 35). Therefore, as per their definition, LEZs contribute to greenhouse gas emissions reduction.

In addition, the 24 regulatory studies each provide information concerning the expected improvement in air quality. For example, in the case of Lyon – one of the agglomerations regularly surpassing the regulatory threshold for air quality – the study presents the methodology used by ATMO-Auvergne-Rhône-Alpes (part of ATMO France, the federation of air quality monitoring associations) to assess the impact of the new stricter LEZ on air quality and details the impacts identified in terms of air quality regarding the three main pollutants: nitrogen oxide (NO_x) and fine particles (PM₁₀ and PM_{2.5}) (p. 45-59 of evidence 6). Most notably it estimates a progressive decline in NO_x emissions of up to 21% in 2028, as compared to a reference scenario without the stricter LEZ but which includes the current trend in the evolution of cars, uptake in bike travel and public transport (p. 46). It also estimates a reduction in fine particles of close to 12% by 2028 as compared to the same reference scenario (p. 48). The assessment of the expected improvements to air quality can be found in all of the 24 regulatory studies provided (pages 54 to 59 of evidence 3 for Bordeaux; pages 56 to 60 of evidence 4 for Annecy; pages 96 to 101 of evidence 5 for Grenoble; pages 46 to 59 of evidence 6 for Lyon; pages 46 to 49 of evidence 7 for Saint-Etienne; pages 57 to 60 of evidence 8 for Nancy; pages 86 to 99 of evidence 9 for Strasbourg; pages 65 to 73 of evidence 10 for Caen; pages 49 to 50 of evidence 11 for Montpellier; pages 91 to 102 of evidence 12 for Nantes; pages 36 to 42 of evidence 13 for Le Havre; page 51 of evidence 14 for Annemasse; pages 54 to 59 of evidence 15 for Bayonne; pages 33 to 37 of evidence 16 for Clermont-Ferrand; page 72 of evidence 17 for Dijon; pages 54 to 67 of evidence 18 for Rennes; pages 46 to 58 of evidence 19 for Pau; pages 60 to 66 of evidence 20 for Nîmes; pages 21 to 24 of evidence 21 for Angers; pages 56 to 60 of evidence 22 for Brest; pages 51 to 60 of evidence 23 for Chambéry; pages 39 to 52 of evidence 24 for Lille; pages 32 to 39 of evidence 25 for Mulhouse; and at pages 5 to 7 of evidence 29 and pages 46 to 48 of evidence 31 for Paris).

Furthermore, as explained in the summary document (evidence 1) the creation of low-emission zones concurs with a shift in modes of transport and the renewal of the car fleet – in part toward electric cars. In addition to improving air quality, LEZs therefore reduce greenhouse gas emissions. Seven of the agglomerations included as part of their regulatory studies further demonstrations of the correlation between the creation of a LEZ and the contribution to greenhouse gas emissions reduction for their agglomerations (pages 57 of evidence 4 for Annecy; page 102 of evidence 5 for Grenoble; pages 61 to 66 of evidence 6 for Lyon; page 88 of evidence 9 for Strasbourg; page 44 of evidence 31 for Paris; page 57 of evidence 10 for Caen; and page 57 of evidence 18 for Rennes). For example, in Annecy CO₂ emissions are expected to decrease by an extra 0.4% in 2030 due to the LEZ implementation as compared to 2022, while in Grenoble the expected greenhouse gas emissions reduction between 2022 and 2025 is as high as an additional nine percentage points depending on the LEZ scenario.

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment: Satisfactorily fulfilled.

Number and name of the Target: 3-19 Public transport reserved lanes

Related Measure: C3.I3 Daily mobility: development of public transport

Quantitative Indicator: Km

Baseline: 0

Target: 20

Time: Q4 2024

1. Context:

The measure aims at financing the development of rail infrastructure for daily mobility in urban areas, to increase their attractiveness. The measure aims to address congestion issues in the Ile de France region by supporting the creation of new urban metro lines and decarbonizing transport through electric traction, co-financing improvements in RER E, B, and D train lines, the deployment of tram lines T3 and T1, high-service buses TZ 2 and 3, and supporting a new metro line in Toulouse, involving all steps from studies to construction.

The target concerns the number of kilometres (20) of renovated or newly created public transport reserved lanes, tracks or railways.

Target 3-19 is the second target of the investment, and it follows the completion of milestone 3-18, related to the adoption by the *Agence de financement des infrastructures de transport de France* (AFITF) board of funding agreements. It will be followed by target 3-20, related to number of kilometres of renovated or newly created public transport reserved lanes with a baseline of 20 kms and a goal of 100 km. Target 3-20 is expected to cover the remaining projects mentioned in the measure description, both in the Ile-de-France region and in Toulouse, as well as preparatory steps ahead of actual works.

The investment has a final expected date for implementation in Q2 2026.

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence	Short description
1	Summary document 3-19	A summary document duly justifying how the target was satisfactorily fulfilled in line with the requirements set out in the Council Implementing Decision Annex.
2	List of projects	Excel table detailing the projects submitted for target 3-19.
3	Extension of Metro line 12 (Paris) – extract from the exploitation plan of the extension	Extract from the exploitation plan of the extension, indicating the track line between the platform kilometre point of the departure station of the extension, FRONT POPULAIRE at 13.811 km and the platform tail of the terminal station of the extension, Mairie d' Aubervilliers at 15.647 km, i.e. a line of 1.836 km of double railway tracks for passengers.

4	Extension of Metro line 12 (Paris) – contract GDI 200069: ‘Extension of the Centralised Command System (PCC) to extend Line 12 of Front Populaire in Mairie d’Aubervilliers’	Contract for the extension of metro line 12 from Front Populaire to Mairie d’Aubervilliers’, awarded and signed on 30 June 2020.
5	Extension of Metro line 12 (Paris) – report of entry into service of the PCC version of line 12	Record of acceptance and commissioning on 28 April 2022 of the works for line 12, signed by the contractor and the contracting authority.
6	Extension of Metro line 11 (Paris) – market MOP210009: ‘Supply and installation of dry standpipes and cold water networks in tunnels and related works’	Contract awarded to the contractor and signed on 15 February 2021.
7	Extension of Metro line 11 (Paris) – test specifications prior to putting dry columns into service	Test specifications validating the correct operation for works located between kilometre point 6.500 and 11.223, i.e. a linear line of 4.7 km, covered by Market MOP210009. This was submitted in its final form on 19 September 2024.
8	Extension of Tramway T3 Ouest (Paris) – MOP210049 contract: line infrastructure works, track works and rail supply	Contract signed with Colas Rail/Colas Ile-de-France Normandy group on 12 May 2021.
9	Extension of Tramway T3 Ouest (Paris) – technical plans of tracks at terminal stations: T3O (2.1) - EXE-PLA-PL01-VFE-PFV-03629-G.pdf	Technical plans indicating the track line between the kilometre point of the platform head of the terminal of the extension, Porte d’Asnières- Marguerite Long, 36- 234.23 km and the kilometre point of the platform head of the terminal station of the extension, Porte Dauphine, 39-320 km, i.e. a linear line of 3.086 km of double lanes for passengers.
10	Extension of Tramway T3 Ouest (Paris) – technical plans of tracks at terminal stations: T3O (2.2) - EXE-PLA-PL26-VFE-PFV-03646-C.pdf	Technical plans of the track works of the terminal stations of the extension indicating the track line between the kilometre point of the platform head of the terminal of the extension, Porte d’Asnières- Marguerite Long, 36- 234.23 km and the kilometre point of the platform head of the terminal station of the extension, Dauphine port, 39-320 km, i.e. a linear line of 3.086 km of double lanes for passengers.
11	Extension of Tramway T3 Ouest (Paris) – notification of decision to accept line infrastructure works, track works and rail supply	Notification of decision on general acceptance of works, dated 2 May 2024, confirming completion of the works on 29 March 2024 and satisfactory acceptance of the track line of the extension.

12	Extension of RER E (Paris) to West (EOLE) – contract VCM-GLO-Ferrovary equipment works – Special Technical Specifications	Extract from the Special Technical Specifications of the contract signed with the TSO Groupement TSO – EIFFAGE RAIL – TSO CATENAIRES SAGES RAIL. This extract mentions on page 7 ‘3.1 GENERAL DESCRIPTION’ the 8.5 km double track line for the underground tunnel section between Haussmann-Saint-Lazare and Nanterre- la-Folie.
13	Extension of RER E (Paris) to West (EOLE) – market VCM-GLO-T for Ferrovary equipment – PO No. 0082	Service order dated 29 June 2021 referring to the early roll-over of the optical fibre to Nanterre-la-Folie station at kilometre point 10 + 547.
14	Extension of RER E (Paris) to West (EOLE) – market VCM-GLO-Ferrovary equipment works – PO No. 0086	Service order dated 5 August 2021, on signalling cables from Item 81 in the tunnel from PK 2 + 082.
15	Extension of RER E (Paris) to West (EOLE) – Market VCM-GLO-T of Ferrovary equipment – minutes of operations prior to acceptance	Decision concerning acceptance of the works signed on 11 April 2024, certifying that the works had been completed on 13 March 2024 and that the track line of the extension has been properly received.
16	Tram TL2 – Tram-Train Massy – ÉvryCourcouronnes- urban section under MOA Ilede-France Mobilités – First page of the board for works executed under the contract for the construction of the Track on the urban section of operation T1 2	Extract of the exploitation plan under the contract for the construction of the Track on the urban section of T12, enabling the identification of the kilometre point at metre 20,356 of the SNCF laying limit, which marks the start of the urban section.
17	Tram TL2 – Tram-Train Massy – ÉvryCourcouronnes- urban section under MOA Ilede-France Mobilités – last page of the board on the works carried out under the contract for the construction of the Track on the urban section of operation T1 2	Extract of the exploitation plan under the contract for the construction of the Track on the urban section of T12, enabling the identification of the kilometre point at the end of the urban section. The departure and arrival kilometre points thus delimit a linear line of 10 197 metres, i.e. 10.2 km.
18	Tram TL2 – Tram-Train Massy – ÉvryCourcouronnes- urban section under MOA Ilede-France Mobilités – act of commitment for Lot 1 of contract No. 2020-118	Act of commitment – marking the start of the works signed and notified to the holder of this lot (VTMTP) on 26 March 2021.
19	Tram TL2 – Tram-Train Massy – ÉvryCourcouronnes- urban section under MOA Ilede-France Mobilités – Special Technical Specifications (TTC) for the civil works of the stations	Special Technical Specifications for works relating to the civil engineering of stations and the construction of plant furniture.
20	Tram TL2 – Tram-Train Massy – ÉvryCourcouronnes- urban section under MOA Ilede-France Mobilités – decision to accept works relating to the civil engineering of the stations	Decision of acceptance of works relating to the Civil Engineering of Stations of Operation T12, dated 29 March 2024, confirming completion of the works by 8 December 2023.

21	Tram TL2 – Tram-Train Massy – ÉvryCourcouronnes- railway section under MOA SNCF-technical plans of PAI No. 25	Technical plan for computerised switch station No. 25 and Petit-Vaux station, which makes it possible to identify – via red markings – the kilometre point of the head of platform, at km 96,6 – marking the departure of the T12 railway section in commercial operation.
22	Tram TL2 – Tram-Train Massy – ÉvryCourcouronnes- railway section under MOA SNCF-technical plans of AIP No. 23 and 24	Technical plan for signalling the computerised switch points No 23 and 24 at Massy-Palaiseau station, which makes it possible to identify – via red markings – the kilometre point of the platform tail, at km 106,3, marking the arrival of the T12 railway section in commercial operation. The kilometre point of departure and arrival of this section thus define a linear line of 9.7 km of improved line.
23	Tram TL2 – Tram-Train Massy – ÉvryCourcouronnesRailway section under MOA SNCF – Description of the OA4 market notice	Description of contract on engineering works in the new stations of Champlan and Massy- Europe of the T12.
24	Tram TL2 – Tram-Train Massy – ÉvryCourcouronnes- railway section under MOA SNCF-Service Order No. 1 marking the start of work on contract OA4	Service order (OS) certifying the start of the works on 9 June 2020.
25	Tram TL2 – Tram-Train Massy – Courier – Railway section under MOA SNCF – Report of acceptance of works under contract OA4	Acceptance report, drawn up and accepted on 6 October 2023 of works, addressed to the contractor COLAS Génie Civil, certifying the completion of the works by 30 June 2023 and the satisfactory acceptance of the works under this contract. The supervisor was notified of the acceptance decision of the person responsible for the contract on 7 December 2023.
26	Tram TL2 – Tram-Train Massy – Courier – Railway section under MOA SNCF- Special Technical Specifications (CCTP) of the MET1 contract	Special Technical Specifications of contract for works on all stations in the T12 railway section (PETIT vaux, GRAVIGNY-BALIZY, CHILLY- Mazarin, Longjumeau, CHAMPLAN, MASSY-EUROPE and Massy-Palaiseau).
27	Tram TL2 – Tram-Train Massy – ÉvryCourcouronnes- railway section under MOA SNCF-Service Order No. 1 marking the start of work on the MET1 contract	Service order (OS) confirming the start of the works on 22 November 2021.
28	Tram TL2 – Tram-Train Massy – Courier – Railway section under MOA SNCF – Report of acceptance of works under contract MET1	Acceptance report, drawn up on 23 July 2024 and accepted on 5 August 204, of works, addressed to the holder SVMS – Signature Vertical & Mobility Solutions,

		certifying that the works have been completed by 20 June 2024.
29	Extension of the RER E (Paris) to the West (EOLE) – press pack of the inauguration of the extension to Nanterre	Press pack of the inauguration of the extension of RER E to Nanterre: page 4.
30	EOLE_levée des réserves_08-11-2024.pdf	Attestation to the lifting of reservations for the works on RER E.
31	T12-IDFM_EXE9_levée totale des réserves_GCS_signé moad_04-12-2024.pdf	Confirmation of the lifting of reservations for the works on T12 for the section operated by Ile-de-France Mobilités.
32	T12-SNCF-PV_de_levée_des_reserves_OA4_11-12-2024.pdf	Confirmation of the lifting of reservations for the section operated by SNCF, for the works on the creation of new stations (Champlan and Massy Europe).
33	T12-SNCF-PV_de_levée_des_réserves_MET1_21-11-2024.pdf	Confirmation of the lifting of reservations for the section operated by SNCF, for the metalwork and station adaptation works.
34	240305_Arrêté 2024-0167 Approbation DS T3b Pte Dauphine.pdf	Commissioning order certifying the conformity of the installations that enables commercial service to begin, dated 05 March 2024.

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the target.

Number of kilometres of renovated of newly created public transport reserved lanes.

The target of 20 km is reached with a total of 38 km of renovated or newly created public transport lanes, tracks or railways, under the following five projects:

- Extension of metro line 12 to Mairie d'Aubervilliers – phase 2 (1.8 km)
- Extension of line 11 from Mairie des Lilas to Rosny-Bois-Perrier (4.7 km)
- Extension of the T3b tram to the Dauphine Porte (3.1 km)
- Extension of RER E to West – EOLE project – phase 1 to Nanterre La Folie (8.5 km)
- Creation of the Tram-train T12 Express Massy-Evry (19.9 km).

These projects are detailed in the list of projects (evidence 2), where for each project there are specifications on the location of the project (column C), a description of the project (column D), unique reference number (column B), date of commitment of financing agreements (column E), date of commissioning of created or renovated project (column F), and number of kilometres of linear created or renovated (column G). For each of the projects, France provided documents establishing the type of works concerned (contracts, Special Technical Specifications, service orders), the kilometres concerned (contracts, exploitation plans, technical plans of track works, Special Technical Specifications, technical plans), documents attesting to the completion of works (records of

acceptance of works, test specifications) and, where needed, confirmations to the lifting of reservations for the works covered by target 3-19.

For metro line 12, the works concern the extension and modification of the centralised command station, which is a prerequisite for the metro extension (see the extract from the exploitation plan demonstrating kilometres concerned, evidence 3, the contract for these works, evidence 4, and the record of acceptance, evidence 5). The corresponding metro extension on line 12 was subsequently put into service on 31 May 2022. For metro line 11, the works concern the supply and installation of a network of dry standpipes and cold water, necessary for the fire safety of the extension (see the contract for these works, also demonstrating kilometres concerned, evidence 6 and the test specifications attesting to the good functioning of these works, evidence 7) and a prerequisite for the metro extension. The corresponding metro extension on line 11 was subsequently put into service on 13 June 2024. For tram T3b, the works concern line infrastructure works, road works and rail supply (see the contract for these works, evidence 8, the technical plans of the track works demonstrating kilometres concerned, evidence 9 and 10, and the notification of the acceptance of the works, evidence 11, and the commissioning order certifying the conformity of the installations that enables commercial service to begin, evidence 34). For the extension of RER E, the works concern the unwinding of signalling cables and optical fibre (see the extract of the Special Technical Specifications, mentioning the underground section of 8.5 km in page 10 and the works on signalling cables and optical fibre, evidence 12, the service orders for these works, evidences 13 and 14, the attestation of achievement of these works, evidence 15, and the confirmation of the lifting of reservations, evidence 30). For tram-train line T12, the project is operated under the joint management of Ile de France Mobilités (hereafter IDFM) and the SNCF. For the section operated by IDFM, the works concern the creation of 10.2 km of public transport reserved lanes (see extracts of the exploitation plan demonstrating the kilometres concerned, evidences 16 and 17, the act of commitment for the works on civil engineering of stations and realisation of stations' equipment, evidence 18, the Special Technical Specifications for these works, evidence 19, the decision of acceptance of these works, evidence 20, and the confirmation of the lifting of these works, evidence 31). For the railway section operated by the SNCF, the works concern infrastructure improvements, works on adaptation of stations previously operated for RER, civil engineering works, or works of installation of equipment and systems for operation (see technical plans demonstrating the kilometres concerned, evidence 21 and 22). For the works on stations on this line, see the description of the civil engineering works for the stations Champlan and Massy-Europe, evidence 23, service order for these works, evidence 24, acceptance report for these works, evidence 25, and confirmation of the lifting of reservations for these works, evidence 32. For the works on metalwork and stations' adaptation, including works on the entire scope of metal framework, see the Special Technical Specifications, evidence 26, the service order, evidence 27, the acceptance report, evidence 28 and the confirmation of the lifting of reservations, evidence 33.

Furthermore, in line with the measure description, **the measure shall focus on the Ile de France region around Paris, to solve recurrent congestion issues.**

The five projects implemented for target 3-19 are located in the Ile de France region around Paris. The largest project is the extension of the RER E urban rail line to the west (EOLE project). According to the traffic forecasts from the preparatory studies, this extension will shift close to 12% of RER A passengers in the central section (between Châtelet-les-Halles and La Défense) to line E during the morning rush hour, and 12% of RER B and D passengers (between Gare du Nord and Châtelet-les-Halles) and traffic at Saint-Lazare station (Europe's second busiest station). This project helps solve congestion problems

on these urban rail lines. This information is presented in the press kit for the inauguration of the RER E extension to Nanterre (evidence 29, p. 4).

Furthermore, in line with the measure description, **eligible projects are mostly based on electric traction, which shall participate to decarbonisation of transport.**

All the projects submitted under this target are based on electric traction: the extensions of lines 11 and 12 of the Paris metro are fully towed via the third traction rail, the tramway line T3b is towed by overhead contact line, the tram-train line T12 is towed by overhead contact line, and the extension of the RER E is towed by overhead contact line.

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment: Satisfactorily fulfilled

Number and name of the Target: 3-25 Projects realised on waterways

Related Measure: C3.I4 Acceleration of work on transport infrastructure

Quantitative Indicator: Number

Baseline: 0

Target: 100

Time: Q4 2024

1. Context:

The purpose of the measure is to modernise existing transport infrastructure to adapt it to new means of transport, local needs and green transition. It shall facilitate alternatives to private cars and increase digitisation and integration of new technologies for the functioning and surveillance of the river infrastructure together with the modernisation of the digital management system of the maritime affairs and the CROSS network (Regional Operational Centres for Monitoring and Rescue).

The target relates to the finalisation of 100 renovation and modernisation projects for waterways, including locks and dams.

Target 3-25 is the fifth milestone or target of the investment, and it follows the completion of milestone 3-21 related to the AFITF funding agreement, milestone 3-22 related to the signature by the ASP (*l'Agence de Services et de Paiement*) of the funding agreement for new charging stations, target 3-23 related to charging stations and target 3-24 related to Kilometres of reserved lanes completed. It is followed by milestone 3-26, related to the modernisation of the CROSS network and the numerical system for the maritime affairs. The investment has a final expected date for implementation in Q4 2024.

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence.	Short description
1	Summary document authored by Directorate-General for Infrastructure, Transport and Mobilities (DGITM) of Ministry of Territorial Planning and Decentralisation (MATD) of the French Republic	A summary document duly justifying how the target was satisfactorily fulfilled in line with the requirements set out in the Council Implementing Decision Annex.
2	Project list authored by Directorate-General for Infrastructure, Transport and Mobilities (DGITM) of Ministry of Territorial Planning and Decentralisation (MATD) of the French republic on the base of data extracted from the informatic system of the administrative establishment Waterways of France (<i>Voies navigables de France – VNF</i>) in October 2024	List of the 112 realised on waterways.
3	Copy of Article L4311-1 of Law No. 2012-77 of 24 January 2012 on inland	This article describes the role of the public administrative establishment

	waterways of France (OJ No. 0021 of 25 January 2012)	Waterways of France, to which the State has entrusted the operation, upkeep, maintenance, improvement, extension, and promotion of inland waterways.
4	Call for tenders and/or technical specifications	Document describing the works to be carried out. Hereinafter referred to as 'work description document'.
5	Commitment act and/or work order form	Document related to the order of the works. Hereinafter referred to as 'legal commitment'.
6	Reception Decision and/or Certificate of service	Document certifying that the works have been completed. Hereinafter referred to as 'completion document'.

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the target.

Finalisation of the renovation and modernisation projects for waterways, including locks and dams. Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the renovation of river networks, in particular locks and dams, is also foreseen.**

The evidence provided by the French authorities confirmed the finalisation of at least 100 renovation and modernisation projects for waterways, including locks and dams.

The French authorities provided a list of 112 projects (evidence 2) with for each project: the transaction number, the project name and its description, the location of the project, the start and completion dates.

Out of the 112 projects included in the list, 90 projects relate to renovation works. Out of these 90 renovation projects, 49 projects (54 %) concern locks and dams, showing that a particular attention was put on this type of infrastructure.

Following the selection of a random sample of 60 units, France submitted a work description document (evidence 4), a legal commitment (evidence 5), and a completion document (evidence 6). The evidence provided for a sample of 58 units confirmed that the requirements of the target have been met. One of the successful 58 units concerns a project related to tree felling, in light of the fact that i) it concerned trees that are part of the structure of waterway banks ii) that the trees were affected by colored canker which caused branches to fall which negatively affected the usage of the concerned waterways iii) that felling of the trees allowed operation on these waterways to return to normal. A statistical analysis was carried out taking into account the overachievement of the target of 112 for a required 100. Based on this, there is statistical assurance that the target has been met, and all its constitutive elements have been satisfactorily fulfilled.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, the measure **shall increase digitalisation and integration of new technologies for the functioning and surveillance of the river infrastructure to make it a credible alternative to road freight transport.**

The evidence provided by the French authorities confirmed that the projects increased digitalisation and integration of new technologies for the functioning and surveillance of the river.

The analysis of the provided work description documents (evidence 4), legal commitments (evidence 5), and completion documents (evidence 6) confirmed that several projects were related to the installation of optical fibre and that optical fibre installation is part of the modernisation programme to enable digital remote operation to be installed on the high-gauge locks. Optical fibre is the data transmission vector that allows remote operation of locks and thus allow users to pass through without the presence of an agent at each lock. This demonstrates the increase in digitalisation and the integration of new technology for the functioning and surveillance of the river infrastructure.

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment: Satisfactory fulfilled

Number and name of the Milestone: 3-26 Modernisation of the CROSS network and numerical system for the maritime affairs

Related Measure: C3.I4 Acceleration of work on transport infrastructure

Qualitative Indicator: Report evidencing the completion of the works

Time: Q4 2024

1. Context:

The purpose of the measure is to modernise existing transport infrastructure to adapt it to new means of transport, local needs and green transition. It shall facilitate alternatives to private cars and increase digitisation and integration of new technologies to the river infrastructure together with the modernisation of the information system of the maritime affairs and the CROSS network (Regional Operational Centres for Monitoring and Rescue).

Milestone 3-26 requires the completion of the modernisation of the CROSS network and numerical system for the maritime affairs.

Milestone 3-26 is the sixth and last milestone of the investment, and it follows the completion of milestone 3-21 related to the AFITF funding agreement, milestone 3-22 related to the signature by the ASP (*l'Agence de Services et de Paiement*) of the funding agreement for new charging stations, target 3-23 related to charging stations and target 3-24 related to kilometres of reserved lanes completed, target 3-25 related to the finalisation of 100 renovation and modernisation projects for waterways, including locks and dams.

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence	Short description
1	Summary document authored by Directorate-General for Maritime Affairs, Fisheries and Aquaculture (DGAMPA) of Ministry of Ecological Transition and Transport (MTECT) of the French republic	A summary document duly justifying how the target was satisfactorily fulfilled in line with the requirements set out in the Council Implementing Decision Annex.
2	Report authored by Directorate-General for Maritime Affairs, Fisheries and Aquaculture (DGAMPA) evidencing the completion of the works	Report on the modernisation of the network of CROSS. Hereinafter referred to as 'report on completion'.
3	Scoping note on the operations on CROSS for the recovery plan, authored in October 2020 by the Directorate for Maritime Affairs of the	Note outlining the modernisation program of the CROSS network and the maritime affairs' digital management system in the context of the NRRP. Hereinafter referred to as 'scoping note'.

	Directorate-General for Infrastructure, Transport and the Sea. (PJ4_3-26 Note blanche CROSS_Plan de relance_20201019+ PJ4bis_3-26_courriel)	
4	Project list authored by Directorate-General for Maritime Affairs, Fisheries and Aquaculture (DGAMPA) of Ministry of Ecological Transition and Transport (MTECT) of the French republic based on the information system of the DGAMPA and accounting system Chorus (PJ1_3-26 Liste des projets_PNRR_version actualisée 12022025_VDEF.xlsx)	List showing finalised projects and sub-projects implemented in the framework of measure 3-26. One part concerns the modernisation of the CROSS network and the second one concerns the modernisation of the maritime affairs' digital management system. Hereinafter referred to as 'list of projects'.
5	Call for tenders and/or technical specifications	Document describing the works to be carried out. Hereinafter referred to as 'work description document'.
6	Commitment act and/or work order form	Document related to the order of the works. Hereinafter referred to as 'legal commitment'.
7	Reception Decision and/or Certificate of service	Document certifying that the works have been completed. Hereinafter referred to as 'completion document'.

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the milestone.

The Council Implementing Decision required, in line with the qualitative indicator for the milestone, a report evidencing the completion of the works.

The French authorities provided a report on completion evidencing the completion of the works (see evidence 2). This report entitled 'Report on completion of milestone 3-26: Modernisation of the CROSS network and the digital maritime system' and prepared by the Directorate-General for Maritime Affairs, Fisheries and Aquaculture (DGAMPA) provides a detailed description of the steps taken to complete the modernisation of the of the CROSS network and numerical system for the maritime affairs.

Completion of the modernisation of the CROSS network and numerical system for the maritime affairs.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the modernisation of the digital management system for maritime affairs and the CROSS network (Regional Operational Centres for Monitoring and Rescue)**

The French authorities provided a report on completion evidencing the completion of the works (evidence 2), along with a scoping note (evidence 3). This scoping note, issued ex-ante, outlines the necessary actions (i.e. 'key elements') for the modernisation. Additionally, a list of projects referencing 36 projects was provided (evidence 4). For each project the list includes the project name, the description, and start date. The report on completion details each of the 'key elements' included in the scoping note (evidence 3), as well as the projects corresponding to each of these 'key elements' and further referenced in the list of projects (evidence 4).

In addition, the French authorities provided, for each project listed, a work description document (evidence 5), a legal commitment (evidence 6), and a completion document (evidence 7).

The CROSS network consists of several regional maritime operational surveillance and rescue centres spread over the country, acting as Maritime Rescue Coordination Centres (MRCC). The Council Implementing Decision states that the modernisation of the CROSS network and numerical system for the maritime affairs must be completed. The scoping note was issued in October 2020 by the Directorate-General for Maritime Affairs, Fisheries and Aquaculture (DGAMPA), before the adoption of the Council Implementing Decision in July 2021. In light of the interpretation of this requirement from the Council Implementing Decision, it is interpreted that the modernisation of the CROSS network and numerical system for the maritime affairs is defined as the modernisation plan outlined in the scoping note listing the necessary key elements for the modernisation. Out of the 36 projects referenced in the list of projects, 27 projects cover 'key elements' included in the scoping note and are comprising i) 11 projects related to the CROSS network, and ii) 16 projects related to the numerical system (i.e. digital management system) for maritime affairs. The evidence provided confirmed that these 27 projects were completed and corresponded to the information included in the project list. For one of the 'key elements' of the scoping note (i.e. Renovation of the Stiff tower and installation of a high-performance radar at this hotspot), the building renovation itself was postponed. Whilst this constitutes a minimal substantive deviation from the requirement of the Council Implementing Decision, as interpreted in light of the scoping note, the modernisation of the radar and radio equipment of the Stiff tower was nevertheless completed. Furthermore, the French authorities provided a work description document (evidence 5), a legal commitment (evidence 6), and a completion document (evidence 7) evidencing the completion of nine additional sub-projects (which, together with the 27 projects already referenced, lead to the total of 36 projects) for the CROSS network which were carried out in addition to the framework set out in the scoping note. These projects concern among other equivalent building renovation projects which also contribute to the improvement of the CROSS network, in line with the ambition outlined in the ex-ante note. As of this, this minimal deviation does not change the nature of the measure and does not affect the progress towards achieving the investment that the milestone represents. On this basis, it is considered that this constitutive element of the milestone is satisfactorily fulfilled.

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment: Satisfactory fulfilled

Number and name of the Milestone: 6-7 Awards of contracts – implementing decision of the Prime Minister

Related Measure: C6.I2 Innovating for the resilience of our business models

Qualitative Indicator: Report from the ‘Secrétariat Général pour l’Investissement’ (SGPI)

Time: Q4 2024

1. Context:

The objective of this measure is to support investment for the development of key digital technologies, as part of France’s fourth future-oriented investment programme ‘Programme d’Investissements d’Avenir’ (PIA4).

Milestone 6-7 concerns the award of contracts – implementing decisions of the Prime Minister following the closure of the calls for proposals/interest launched under milestone 6-6, allowing contractualisation with beneficiaries.

Milestone 6-7 is the third and last milestone of the investment, and it follows the completion of target 6-5 related to the number of ‘acceleration strategies’ validated and milestone 6-6, related to the launch of the calls for proposals or interest.

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence	Short description
1	Summary document <i>‘6-7 PIA Technologies numériques clés_SD’</i>	A summary document duly justifying how the milestone was satisfactorily fulfilled in line with the requirements set out in the Council Implementing Decision Annex.
2	Lists of beneficiaries <i>‘6-7 Liste des bénéficiaires’</i>	A list of the projects and beneficiaries benefiting from the support. The excel table includes two tabs: <ul style="list-style-type: none">- The first tab contains the list of calls for projects launched under the six acceleration strategies validated under milestone 6-6.- The second tab contains the list of all beneficiaries (and corresponding projects financed under these schemes), with the call for projects in question (column D), the Prime Minister’s financing decision number (columns B and C), the project description (column L), the location (column K) and the NAF/APE code identifying the sector concerned (columns M and N).
2.1	Cahier des charges <i>‘Accélérateur cyber’</i> <i>‘Accélérateurs MSV-SFE’</i> <i>‘Alternatives vertes’</i> <i>‘Télécoms 5G VFF’</i>	Cahier des charges indicating the date of closure of the calls.

	<p>‘Cloture CMA version JORF’</p> <p>‘Développement infrastructures ouvertes pérennes’</p> <p>‘Espace de données mutualisées - Vague 2’</p> <p>‘PRMI2426281A_Clature AAP Soutenir les alternatives vertes 2’</p> <p>‘Réseaux privés 5G Franco-allemand’</p> <p>‘Solutions innovantes pour les réseaux du futur 5G 6G’</p> <p>‘Soutien au déploiement des projets e-FRAN’</p> <p>‘Technologies cyber innovantes critiques V3’</p> <p>‘Technologies cyber innovantes critiques 2’</p>	
3	<p>Standard application file</p> <p><i>‘complétude du dossier’,</i></p> <p><i>‘grille impacts’,</i></p> <p><i>‘guideporteurs aide completion grille impacts’</i></p> <p><i>‘Présentation acronyme nomporteur’, ‘prévi éco nom candidat’, ‘fiche demande aide nom candidat’ ; ‘Guide PICXEL candidate’, ‘guide porteurs – éléments génériques’, ‘guide porteurs – aide grill d’impact DNSH’</i></p>	Standard application templates, including a grid of environmental impacts and a guide about how to fill it in.
4	<p>Sectoral DNSH guides</p> <p><i>‘guide porteurs –agri agro’, ‘guide porteurs – chimie’ ; ‘guide porteurs – numérique’ ; ‘guide porteurs – santé’ ; ‘guide porteurs – transport’ ; ‘guide porteurs – transverse</i></p>	Sectoral DNSH guides developed by Bpifrance and made available to project promoters to enable them to improve the quality of DNSH analysis through impact grids.
5	<p>Common provisions PIA4</p> <p>‘Dispositions communes’</p>	Convention of 8 April 2021 between the State and the operators governing the provisions common to the conventions relating to the implementation of PIA4.
6	<p>Note on the selection process</p>	Procedure sheet relating to the project selection process in France 2030, validated in COMEX on 13 September 2022.

	<i>'note processus de sélection des projets France 2030 validée par COMEX'</i>	
7	Decision statements for each of the six strategies	Copy of all decision statements of the Steering Committees where the projects - of the calls launched for each of the six strategies - were selected (25 statements).
8	60 implementing decisions of the Prime Minister	For 60 beneficiaries, the related implementing decisions of the Prime Minister following the closure of the call, allowing contractualisation.
9	60 example projects	For 60 example projects, one or more documents providing a description of the project and its activities. These documents are contracts; and/or applications for support from the beneficiary of the support; and/or technical annexes to the contract.
10	Assessment procedure of public investments [from milestone 6-8]	Copy of the publication of Decree No. 2013-1211 of 23 December relating to the assessment procedure of public investments, as published in the Official Journal of the French Republic on 26 December 2013 (JOFR No. 0299).
11	Law listing the green transition as an objective of the PIA	Copy of Article 8 of Law No.2010-237 amending finances for 2010 of 9 March 2010, modified by Law No.2021-1900 of 31 December 2021, as published in the Official Journal of the French Republic on 10 March 2010 (JOFR No.0058).

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the milestone.

Implementing decision of the Prime Minister following the closure of the calls for proposals/calls for interest launched under milestone 6-6; allowing contractualisation with the beneficiaries through grant agreements or other contracts for granting funds to be signed.

The evidence provided by France confirmed that the 22 calls for proposals/interest launched under milestone 6-6 (positively assessed under the third payment request submitted by France) were closed (evidence 2 and 2.1). The French authorities provided the links to the webpage of the related calls indicating the date of closure of the calls (evidence 2). When the webpage was obsolete/no longer available, French authorities provided the calls' specifications ('cahier des charges') indicating the date of closure of the related call (evidence 2.1). The calls were all closed between May 2021 and December 2024.

The French authorities provided a list of 682 beneficiaries benefiting from the measure (evidence 2). For each of them, the French authorities provided information on the date and number of the corresponding Prime Minister's financing decision (column A and B), as well as the name of the

corresponding ‘acceleration strategy’ (assessed under target 6-5), name of the corresponding call for projects (assessed under milestone 6-6), and name of the corresponding project (column F, D and G respectively). The French authorities also provided the number in the company directory identification system (column I), the type of beneficiary concerned (column J), its location (column K), a summary of the project description when available (column L) and the NAF/APE code identifying the sector of activity (column M and N). The analysis of the evidence provided for a sample of 60 beneficiaries (see below) confirmed that the implementing decisions of the Prime Minister followed the closure of the calls for proposals/interest launched under milestone 6-6 and allowed contractualization with the beneficiaries through grant agreements or other contracts for granting funds to be signed.

Following the selection of a random sample of 60 units, France submitted the copies of the signed implementing decision of the Prime Minister allowing contractualisation with the beneficiary (evidence 8). The evidence provided for a sample of 60 units confirmed that the requirement of the milestone has been met: the 60 beneficiaries were selected following the closure of calls for projects/interests under milestone 6-6 and were subsequently included in an implementing decision of the Prime Minister, which allowed contractualisation with the beneficiaries through granting aid. The Implementing Decisions of the Prime Minister include, among others, the title of the calls under which the projects are financed, and the beneficiaries with whom contractualisation is allowed. All of the implementing decisions of the Prime Minister provided were signed and referenced at least one of the 22 calls launched under milestone 6-6.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **whenever applicable, environmental criteria are part of the selection criteria for projects, and operators are required to produce a critical analysis of their proposals based on internal and external expertise.**

For France’s third payment request, with regards to the launch of the calls under milestone 6-6, the Commission assessed that, the terms of reference for upcoming calls for projects include an eligibility criterion to ensure the environmental neutrality of the funded solutions. This ensures compliance with the ‘do no significant harm’ principle of Regulation (EU) 2021/241. The Commission’s analysis for milestone 6-6 also confirmed that environmental criteria are part of the selection criteria for projects whenever applicable.

All terms of reference submitted by the French authorities for milestone 6-6, where environmental criteria were part of the selection criteria, required operators to submit a critical analysis of the project’s environmental impact, including references to the European taxonomy. In addition, the 2023 assessment report of the Surveillance Committee for Future-oriented Investments (Comité de surveillance des investissements d’avenir, CSIA) outlined the PIA’s assessment procedure, detailing that the ex-ante assessment of projects is based on the environmental impact grid, which includes six axes (see page 87 of evidence 10):

- i) combating climate change (production of renewable energy, energy efficiency, climate through the reduction of greenhouse gases);
- ii) adaptation to climate change and resilience in the face of environmental risks;
- iii) combating pollution (air, water);
- iv) management of water and marine resources;
- v) transition to a circular economy;
- vi) protecting and restoring biodiversity and ecosystems.

Finally, pursuant to Decree No. 2013-1211 of 23 December 2013 concerning the assessment procedure of public investments, an ex-ante external counter expertise of the socio-economic impact

must be carried out for large projects (over EUR 100 million investment by the state) (see evidence 10).

The standard application file for projects under France 2030, which is a continuation of the PIA4, also requires the submission of an environmental impact grid (evidence 3). This grid requires a critical analysis to demonstrate that projects respect DNSH principle (evidence 3 and 4).

Furthermore, the green transition is listed by law as one of the objectives of the PIA. Pursuant to Article 8 of Law No. 2010-237 amending finances for 2010 of the 9 March 2012, those projects financed by the PIA, among other objectives, aim to accelerate the green transition (Art. 8 point I.B in evidence 11).

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **although the ‘do no significant harm’ provisions of the measure were assessed under the previous milestone of this measure in the third payment request of France, in line with what the Commission had communicated at that time, the exclusion of various activities was confirmed when assessing this milestone. Specifically, the exclusion of (i) activities related to fossil fuels, including downstream use; (ii) activities under the EU Emission Trading System (ETS) achieving projected greenhouse gas emissions that are not lower than the relevant benchmarks; (iii) activities related to waste landfills, incinerators and mechanical biological treatment plants; and (iv) activities where the long-term disposal of waste may cause harm to the environment, was checked.**

The list of projects provided by France (evidence 2) provides a summary of the description of each project selected (column L of tab 1 of evidence 2). Considering the type of projects at stake and their respective objectives, these projects do not relate to activities excluded in accordance with the Council Implementing Decision.

Considering the objectives and the type of projects and beneficiaries targeted by the calls for proposals (key digital technologies), the projects listed appeared to respect the DNSH criteria and do not consist of activities to be excluded in accordance with the CID. For additional confirmation that the list accurately reflects the exclusions, following the selection of 60 example projects, France submitted the convention signed with the beneficiary, or other relevant document, that includes a full description of the project. The evidence provided for these 60 example projects (evidence 9) confirmed that this requirement of the measure has been met. The analysis of the full description of the project and planned activities confirmed that none of the projects selected under the calls for proposals or calls for interest under milestone 6-6 included activities related to fossil fuels, including downstream use; activities under the EU Emission Trading System (ETS) achieving projected greenhouse gas emissions that are not lower than the relevant benchmarks; activities related to waste landfills, incinerators and mechanical biological treatment plants; or activities where the long-term disposal of waste may cause harm to the environment. As such, whilst these ‘do no significant harm’ provisions were already assessed under milestone 6-6 of the third French payment request, this additional check confirms that the selected projects comply with the necessary provisions of the Council Implementing Decision.

The Council Implementing Decision required, in line with the qualitative indicator for the milestone, a report to be provided by the General Secretariat for Investment (SGPI).

The French authorities did not submit nor publish a report. Instead, they submitted the pieces of evidence listed above which were deemed adequate to prove the completion of the milestone. Whilst this constitutes a minimal substantive deviation from the requirement of the Council Implementing Decision, the evidence provided corroborates the completion of the actions required by the milestone. As of this, this minimal deviation does not change the nature of the measure and does not affect the

progress towards achieving the investment that the milestone represents. On this basis, it is considered that this constitutive element of the milestone is satisfactorily fulfilled.

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment: Satisfactorily fulfilled

Number and name of the Milestone: 6-9 Awards of contracts – implementing decision of the Prime Minister

Related Measure: C6.I3 Supporting innovative businesses

Qualitative Indicator: Report from the ‘Secrétariat Général pour l’Investissement’ (SGPI)

Time: Q4 2024

1. Context:

The objective of measure C6.I3 is to finance R&D investments for innovative companies, under the structural component (*‘volet structurel’*) of the fourth future-oriented investments programme (*‘Programme d’Investissements d’Avenir’* (PIA4)). It targets innovative enterprises that, individually or through collaborative programmes, need access to financing to cover the risk inherent to their R&D projects. It includes: i) innovation competitions for start-ups and SMEs; ii) support for structured R&D projects.

Milestone 6-9 concerns the awards of contracts – implementing decision of the Prime Minister following the closure of the calls for proposals/calls for interest launched under milestone 6-8; allowing contractualisation with the beneficiaries.

Milestone 6-9 is the second and last milestone of investment C6.I3 Supporting innovative businesses, and it follows the completion of milestone 6-8 related to the launch calls for proposal or interest.

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence.	Short description
1	M6-9 summary document <i>‘6-9 PIA Entreprises innovantes_SD’</i>	A summary document duly justifying how the target was satisfactorily fulfilled in line with the requirements set out in the Council Implementing Decision Annex.
2	List of beneficiaries <i>‘6-9 Liste des bénéficiaires’</i>	A list of the projects benefiting from the support. The list provides: <ul style="list-style-type: none">- under tab 1: the title of the seven calls launched under milestone 6-8 (column E), link to the publication website for each call (column F), links to the publicly available orders relative to the approval of the terms of reference in the Official Journal (column G), status (closed) of the calls (column H), date of closure (Column I), and the DNSH criteria (column J);- under tab 2, among others: date of the Implementing decisions of the prime minister (column A), number of

		Implementing decisions of the prime minister (column B), number of the modifying Implementing decisions of the prime minister if relevant (column C), title of the call (D), name of the project (column G), name of the beneficiary (column H).
3	Implementing decisions of the prime minister '2.1 – 2.53 DPM'	53 copies of implementing decisions of the prime minister allowing contractualisation of the projects selected under the seven calls launched under milestone 6-8 (documents 2.1 to 2.53).
4	Winners of the 7 th wave of the innovation competitions i-Nov '6.1 Lauréats i-Nov vague 7'	Press release with the winners of the 7 th wave of the innovation competitions i-Nov ('Concours d'innovation i-Nov vague 7') closed on 11 May 2021.
5	Winners of the 8 th wave of the innovation competitions i-Nov '6.2 Lauréats i-Nov vague 8'	Press release with the winners of the 8 th wave of the innovation competitions i-Nov ('Concours d'innovation i-Nov vague 8') closed on 5 October 2021.
6	Winners of the 9 th wave of the innovation competitions i-Nov '6.3 Lauréats i-Nov vague 9'	Press release with the winners of the 9 th wave of the innovation competitions i-Nov ('Concours d'innovation i-Nov vague 9') closed on 22 March 2022.
7	Winners of the 10 th wave of the innovation competitions i-Nov '6.4 Lauréats i-Nov vague 10'	Press release with the winners of the 10 th wave of the innovation competitions i-Nov ('Concours d'innovation i-Nov vague 10') closed on 28 September 2022.
8	Winners of the 11 th wave of the innovation competitions i-Nov '6.5 Lauréats i-Nov vague 11'	Press release with the winners of the 11 th wave of the innovation competitions i-Nov ('Concours d'innovation i-Nov vague 11') closed on 11 April 2023.
9	Descriptions of 60 example projects, including contracts	For 60 projects, one or more documents providing a description of the project and its activities. These documents are contracts; and/or applications for support from the beneficiary of the support; and/or technical annexes to the contract.
10	Terms of Reference of the CORIMER 2022 call for interest closed on 29 March 2022	Terms of Reference of the CORIMER 2022 call providing that projects submitted under the AMI CORIMER 2022 can be redirected to calls under the PIA4 (the structural component 'volet structure') without requiring re-submission.
11	Extract of the General Secretariat for Investment's (SGPI) database concerning one project	Extract of the General Secretariat for Investment's (SGPI) database concerning one project demonstrating its inclusion under 'i-Démo - soutien aux projets structurants de R&D'.

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the milestone.

Implementing decision of the Prime Minister following the closure of the calls for proposals/calls for interest launched under milestone 6-8; allowing contractualisation with the beneficiaries through granting aid to be signed.

The evidence provided by the French authorities confirmed that the signed Implementing Decisions of the Prime Minister (evidence 3) followed the closure of the seven calls for proposals/calls for interest launched under milestone 6-8 (positively assessed under the second payment request submitted by France) and enabled contractualisation with the beneficiaries through granting aid. As indicated in the preliminary assessment of milestone 6-8, the seven calls under milestone 6-8 were already closed by the time of the second payment request:

‘As evidenced in the terms of reference, the two calls under the support for structured R&D projects scheme ‘i-Démo – soutien aux projets structurants de R&D’ were closed respectively on 3 May 2022 and 20 June 2023 (see page 1 of evidence iii.a. and iii.b). The terms of reference for the five calls under the innovation competitions for start-ups and SMEs scheme (‘Concours d’innovation i-Nov’) indicate that wave 7 was closed on 11 May 2021, wave 8 was closed on 5 October 2021, wave 9 was closed on 22 March 2022, wave 10 was closed on 28 September 2022, and wave 11 was closed on 11 April 2023.’

The French authorities provided 53 Implementing Decisions of the Prime Minister following the closure of the calls for proposals/calls for interest launched under milestone 6-8 (evidence 3). The Implementing Decisions of the Prime Minister include, among others, the title of the calls under which the projects are financed, and the beneficiaries with whom contractualisation is allowed. All of the Implementing Decisions of the Prime Minister provided were signed and referenced at least one of the seven calls launched under milestone 6-8.

Calls launched under milestone 6-8	Number of the Implementing Decisions of the Prime Minister following the closure of each call
7 th wave of the innovation competitions i-Nov (‘Concours d’innovation i-Nov vague 7’)	2021-CI-02; 2021-CI-04;
8 th wave of the innovation competitions i-Nov (‘Concours d’innovation i-Nov vague 8’)	2022-ANI-02; 2022-ANI-08; 2022-MAT-03
9 th wave of the innovation competitions i-Nov (‘Concours d’innovation i-Nov vague 9’)	2022-ANI-PIA4-18; 2022-MAT-PIA4-17
10 th wave of the innovation competitions i-Nov (‘Concours d’innovation i-Nov vague 10’)	2023-ANI-PIA4-06; 2023-DEM-FR30-29; 2024-ANI-013027
11 th wave of the innovation competitions i-Nov (‘Concours d’innovation i-Nov vague 11’)	2023-ANI-PIA4-112419; 2023-DEM-PIA4-134
1 st generic projects call ‘i-Demo’ (hereinafter referred to as ‘i-demo 2021’)	2022-ANI-05; 2022-ANI-06; 2022-ANI-09; 2022-ANI-PIA4-11; 2022-ANI-PIA4-12; 2022-ANI-PIA4-14; 2022-ANI-PIA4-15; 2022-ANI-PIA4-16; 2022-ANI-PIA4-21; 2022-ANI-PIA4-24; 2022-ANI-PIA4-25; 2022-ANI-PIA4-26; 2022-ANI-PIA4-28; 2022-DEM-02; 2022-MAT-PIA4-23; 2023-ANI-PIA4-02; 2023-ANI-PIA4-03; 2024-ANI-032170; 2024-ANI-

	062009; 2023-ANI-PIA4-04 (modificative); 2024-ANI-032170 (modificative); 2024-ANI-070132 (modificative)
2 nd generic projects call 'i-Demo' (hereinafter referred to as ' <i>i-demo 2022</i> ')	2023-ANI-PIA4-05; 2023-ANI-PIA4-07; 2023-ANI-PIA4-09; 2023-ANI-PIA4-112271; 2023-ANI-PIA4-121393; 2023-ANI-PIA4-15; 2023-ANI-PIA4-25; 2023-ANI-PIA4-26; 2023-ANI-PIA4-27; 2023-ANI-PIA4-37; 2024-ANI- 011687; 2024-ANI-012095; 2024-ANI-022012; 2024-ANI-031455; 2024-ANI-031927; 2024-ANI-062009; 2024-ANI-062071; 2024-ANI-062607; 2023-ANI-PIA4-13 (modificative); 2023-ANI-PIA4-36 (modificative)

In addition, the French authorities provided a list of 565 projects and beneficiaries (evidence 2) and, following the selection of a random sample of 60 units, the French authorities submitted the contracts with the beneficiaries, including the title of the project, the name of the beneficiary and the call under which the project was being financed (evidence 9). For one project, the French authorities also provided the terms of Reference of the CORIMER 2022 call for interest closed on 29 March 2022 confirming that projects submitted under the CORIMER 2022 could be redirected to calls under the PIA4 (the structural component '*volet structurel*') without requiring re-submission and an extract of the General Secretariat for Investment's (SGPI) database indicating from which call the project stemmed. The evidence provided for this sample of 60 projects confirmed that this requirement – that the Implementing Decisions of the Prime Minister included beneficiaries for whom contractualisation was allowed following the calls for proposals/calls for interest launched under milestone 6-8 – has been met.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the winners of the innovation competitions come from a number of sectors: digital, health, transport and sustainable mobility, renewable energy, etc.**

The evidence provided by France, which includes five press releases detailing the 278 winners of the five calls of the innovation competitions i-Nov ('*Concours d'innovation i-Nov vague 7 - 11*') under this measure with a short project description per winner (evidence 4 to 8), confirmed that the winners of the innovation competitions include, among others, sectors such as digital, health, transport and sustainable mobility, and renewable energy.

For example, in the digital sector, project CAPENVI combines satellite data with in-situ data and socio-economic statistics in order to assess the impact of human activity on the state of an ecosystem, thus determining the maximum environmental capacity of tourist areas (page 35 of evidence 7). In the health sector, the NIUT project (Non-Invasive Ultrasound Therapy for Calcific Aortic Stenosis) aims to check and improve the performance of the second-generation medical device Valvosoft, which is intended to become a reference treatment for Calcific Aortic Stenosis and to facilitate implant placement (page 57 of evidence 5). Concerning sustainable mobility, the project eShuttle aims to design and build the first 100% battery-powered electric passenger ship in the world, with a cruise speed of 80km/h and an autonomy of 25km (page 39 of evidence 4). Finally, with regards to sustainable energy, project Sealence aims to reduce underwater noise emitted by marine works, particularly, by finalising the development phase of an acoustic containment system to drastically

reduce the underwater environmental impact associated with the installation of offshore wind turbines (page 23 of evidence 4).

Furthermore, although the 'do no significant harm' provisions of the measure were assessed under the previous milestone of this measure in the second payment request of France, in line with what the Commission had communicated at that time, the exclusion of various activities was confirmed when assessing this target. **Specifically, the exclusion of (i) activities related to fossil fuels, including downstream use; (ii) activities under the EU Emission Trading System (ETS) achieving projected greenhouse gas emissions that are not lower than the relevant benchmarks; (iii) activities related to waste landfills, incinerators and mechanical biological treatment plants; and (iv) activities where the long-term disposal of waste may cause harm to the environment, was verified.**

The list of projects provided by France (evidence 2) details all the projects listed in the Implementing Decisions of the Prime Minister for the calls for projects or interest (evidence 3). It also confirms that they do not relate to activities excluded under the description of the measure in the Council Implementing Decision (column J of tab 1 of evidence 2). For additional confirmation that the list accurately reflected the exclusions, 60 example projects were extracted from the list of projects (evidence 2) provided by France.

The analysis of the evidence provided by France and describing the projects and their planned activities for the 60 example projects (evidence 9) confirmed that none of these projects selected under the calls for projects/interest under milestone 6-8 include activities related to fossil fuels, including downstream use; activities under the EU Emission Trading System (ETS) achieving projected greenhouse gas emissions that are not lower than the relevant benchmarks; activities related to waste landfills, incinerators and mechanical biological treatment plants; or activities where the long-term disposal of waste may cause harm to the environment. As such, whilst these 'do no significant harm' provisions were already assessed under milestone 6-8 of the second French payment request, this additional verification confirms that the selected projects comply with the necessary provisions of the Council Implementing Decision.

The Council Implementing Decision required, in line with the qualitative indicator for the milestone, a report to be provided by the General Secretariat for Investment (SGPI).

The French authorities did not submit nor publish a report. Instead, they submitted the pieces of evidence listed above which were deemed adequate to prove the completion of the milestone. Whilst this constitutes a minimal substantive deviation from the requirement of the Council Implementing Decision, the evidence provided corroborates the completion of the actions required by the milestone. As of this, this minimal deviation does not change the nature of the measure and does not affect the progress towards achieving the investment that the milestone represents. On this basis, it is considered that this constitutive element of the milestone is satisfactorily fulfilled.

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment: Satisfactorily fulfilled.

Number and name of the Milestone: 6-12 Investments in Ariane 6

Related Measure: C6.I4 Space

Qualitative Indicator: Follow-up of the progress of the European Space Agency by the National Centre for Space Studies (CNES)

Time: Q4 2024

1. Context:

The objective of investment C6.I4 Space is to support three distinct actions:

- i) Respond to calls for financing to finance space programmes, such as scientific missions, development of satellite programmes or financing of the Ariane 6 Programme.
- ii) R&D projects in the following ways: public procurement, call for projects and national competition for space applications.
- iii) Projects in Vernon, the site where the European Space Agency is expected to carry out the first tests to develop 'Prometheus', a reusable and low-cost rocket engine.

Milestone 6-12 concerns the investments for the realisation of the Ariane 6 Programme.

Milestone 6-12 is the third and last milestone of the investment. It follows the completion of target 6-10 related to the award of contract to beneficiaries for an amount of EUR 200 million (i) for calls for projects in areas relevant to the space sector and national competition for space applications ('Space Tour 2021'); and (ii) projects in Vernon (recovery of hydrogen, park of solar panels, modernisation of rocket engine testing facility) and target 6-11 regarding the number of beneficiaries for these call for projects and national competition for space applications ('Space Tour 2021').

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence.	Short description
1	Summary document	Summary document justifying how the milestone was satisfactorily fulfilled.
2	PJ1 - Press material CP038-2024	Press release confirming the successful the launch of the new rocket on 09 July 2024.
3	PJ2 - Ariane 6 programme report	Report of Ariane 6 with mention to the 165 million of investments mentioned in the CID description.
4	PJ3 - Payment decision 1 of 20 December 2021	Official decision for the payment 1.
5	PJ4 - Payment decision 2 of 24 Mars 2022	Official decision for the payment 2.
6	PJ5 - Payment decision 3 of 16 June 2022	Official decision for the payment 3.
7	PJ6 - Payment decision 4 of 24 October 2022	Official decision for the payment 4.

8	PJ8 - Call for contributions to ESA 2022 budget	Confirmation letter ESA-HIF-F-LE -2022-076 of 17 Mars 2022
9	PJ9 - Chart of accounts 2021	Summary of subsidies for contribution ESA – 2021.
10	PJ10 - Chart of accounts 2022	Summary of subsidies for contribution ESA – 2022.
11	PJ 11 Transfers CNES-ESA	Statement of the bank transactions 03 January 2022.
12	PJ 12 Transfers CNES-ESA	Statement of the bank transactions 31 Mars 2022.
13	PJ 13 Transfers CNES-ESA	Statement of the bank transactions 24 June 2022.
14	PJ 14 Transfers CNES-ESA	Statement of the bank transactions 02 November 2022.
15	PJ 15 ESA_PB-ST5_2021_43_ - Report of European Space Agency (ESA)	EUROPEAN SPACE AGENCY SPACE TRANSPORTATION PROGRAMME BOARD of 8 November 2021
16	PJ 16 PB-ST5_318_PP - Proposal for a French position	EUROPEAN SPACE AGENCY PROGRAMME STEERING BOARD SPACE TRANSPORT of 9 November 2021

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the milestone.

Realisation of Ariane 6 Programme

As explained in the Summary document (evidence 1), the Ariane 6 Programme was successfully implemented with the new rocket being successfully launched on 9 July 2024. This is further explained and confirmed by the press report CP038-2024 of the inaugural flight of Ariane 6 (evidence 2), and in the report on the Ariane 6 programme (evidence 3).

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, ad-hoc contribution to the European Space Agency (ESA) for an amount of EUR 165 000 000, to respond to calls for financing launched by the ESA to finance space programmes, such as scientific missions, development of satellite programmes or financing of the Ariane 6 Programme, a rocket launch system development programme managed by the European Space Agency (ESA).

In light of the additional costs incurred due to the health crisis, as identified following the audit of the industrial accounts conducted by the European Space Agency (ESA), an additional financing requirement was established for the Ariane 6 programme to ensure that Europe and France retain an autonomous space programme. The evidence provided (evidence 4 to 14) confirms that an amount of EUR 165 000 000 was transferred in four tranches during 2021 and 2022 from the National Centre for Space Studies (CNES) to the European Space Agency (ESA).

The evidence includes chart accounts, payment decisions, and proof of bank transfer from CNES to ESA.

The Council Implementing Decision required, in line with the qualitative indicator for the milestone, a follow-up of the progress of the European Space Agency by the National Centre for Space Studies (CNES).

The French authorities provide two documents confirming the follow-up was carried out: Report of European Space Agency (ESA) which serves as a basis for the Space Transport Steering Committee indicating the progress of each activity, including the Ariane 6 programme (evidence 15), and the proposal for a French position on November 2021, this sheet summarises all the elements discussed in the steering committees and the associated French position (evidence 16).

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment: Satisfactorily fulfilled

Number and name of the Milestone: 7-14 Annual assessment of measures taken to improve the quality of public spending implemented in the 2023 budgetary law

Related Measure: C7.R5 Assessment of the quality of public expenditure

Qualitative Indicator: Publication of assessment

Time: Q1 2024

1. Context:

The measure aims to evaluate public spending to identify the most efficient expenditures and the inefficient or redundant ones.

This evaluation involves a comprehensive review of the effectiveness of past reforms over the Presidential term, the publication of an audit report on public finances by the Court of Auditors, and the integration of public expenditure assessments into upcoming budgetary laws to ensure greater transparency and accountability.

As part of the measure, from 2023 onward, the impact assessment of public spending is strengthened in connection with the new public finance programming law, becoming a regular practice with a clear scope and timeline, enabling the government to refine financial strategies and improve the quality and efficiency of public spending in alignment with long-term policy objectives.

Milestone 7-14 concerns the annual assessment of the measures taken to improve the quality of public spending, including the savings derived from them, and implemented in the 2023 budgetary law.

Milestone 7-14 is the fifth milestone of the reform, and it follows the completion of milestone 7-11 related to report of the audit mission of the Court of Auditors on public finances, milestone 7-10 related to publication of the results of the productivity reforms, milestone 7-12 related to exit emergency measures under sanitary conditions and milestone 7-13 related to construction of financial laws articulated with public expenditure evaluations covering the scope of public administration in compliance with the expenditure trajectory of the public finance programming law, as well as the strengthening of public expenditure impact assessments from 1 January 2023 and the assessment of the quality of public spending made a regular practice as of 2023 with a clear scope and calendar. Milestone 7-9 related to measure C7.R4 assessed in the third payment request and related to the entry into force of a new Public Finances Programming Law (LPFP) is also relevant for the assessment of milestone 7-14.

It will be followed by milestone 7-14a, related to the assessment of measures taken to improve the quality of public spending since the 2023 budgetary law.

The reform has a final expected date for implementation in Q1 2025.

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence.	Short description
1	Summary document	
2	Rapport d'évaluation ex post Suivi des mesures prises pour améliorer la qualité des dépenses publiques mises en œuvre dans les lois financières pour 2023	Published report detailing spending reviews implemented in the 2023 budget law and social security budget law: Rapport ex post – mesures d'économie dans les lois financières pour 2023.pdf
3	Annex 1 – mesures exécutées en 2023	Annex listing all the measures implemented in 2023 in the budget law and social security budget law, initial costing and savings implemented.
4	Annex 2 – Loi de finances initiale 2024	2024 Budget law.
5	Annex 3 – rapport IGF-CGDD Censi Bouvard	Report on the assessment of the Censi-Bouvard tax reduction, implemented since 2009.
6	Annex 4 – Rapport annuel de performances	Yearly report on the fiscal and financial management of the State and local public authorities.
7	Annex 5 – Projet annuel de performances	Yearly presentation of the indicators, objectives and means allocated to specific public policy objectives.
8	Annex 6 – Rapport à la Commission des comptes de la Sécurité sociale 2024	Report presenting the financial outlook of the social security, with results for 2023 and provisions for 2024.
9	Annex 7 – Rapport d'évaluation des politiques de sécurité sociale 2023	Report presenting the public policy objectives for the social security.
10	Annex 8 – Synthèse du rapport de propositions de l'assurance maladie pour 2023	Report on performance and expenditure of the social security system to improve its quality and control expenditures.

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the milestone.

Annual assessment of measures taken to improve the quality of public spending implemented in the 2023 budgetary law.

The French authorities have provided an *ex-post* evaluation report, *Rapport d'évaluation ex post : suivi des mesures prises pour améliorer la qualité des dépenses publiques mises en œuvre dans les lois*

financières pour 2023, published on 23 January 2025 (hereafter ‘the report’, evidence 2) on measures to improve the quality of public spending included in the budget law (*Loi de finances initiales* – hereafter LFI) and social security budget law (*Loi de financement de la Sécurité sociale* – hereafter LFSS) for 2023, which detailed the underlying expenditure trajectory for that year.

The report assesses the actual implementation of the savings planned in the 2023 LFI and LFSS. It covers three savings areas in the LFI:

- i) Reduction of the taxes affected to Chambers of Commerce and Industry and Chambers of Trades and Crafts;
- ii) End of the tax reduction scheme on the investment in certain types of housing (*dispositif Censi-Bouvard*);
- iii) Reduction of staff in the Directorate-General of public finance (*DGFIP*).

and five savings areas in the LFSS:

- iv) Efficiency measures in medical biology and imaging;
- v) Safeguard clause on healthcare products;
- vi) Efficiency gains in medical cost control;
- vii) Reduction in mandatory health insurance expenses;
- viii) Fight against social fraud and abuse.

Overall, this report allows for the comparison between what was planned and what was actually implemented, with both *ex ante* and *ex post* costing. The report and its Annex 1 (evidence 3) highlight that the amounts of savings actually implemented exceed the *ex-ante* costing originally provided

The Council Implementing Decision required, in line with the qualitative indicator for the milestone, a publication of the assessment.

The report and its Annex 1 were published on 23 January 2025 on the website of the Ministry of the Economy, Finance and Industrial and Digital Sovereignty, at the following link: [Rapport ex post - mesure d'économie dans les lois financières 2023](#)

The underlying expenditure trajectory for the following years shall be detailed in the next financial laws annuals.

The 2024 Budget law (evidence 4) details France’s underlying expenditure trajectory, in line with the public finance programming law assessed under milestone 7-9 in the 3rd payment request (see ‘*Article liminaire*’ of the Law).

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment: Satisfactorily fulfilled

Number and name of the Milestone: 7-19 Investment to increase governmental cybersecurity

Related Measure: C7.I3 Cybersecurity of State services

Qualitative Indicator: Report to be provided by the French Government providing evidence of completion

Time: Q4 2024

1. Context:

The objective of this investment is to increase the cybersecurity capabilities of the French government, by encouraging the development of a competitive cybersecurity offer and reinforce the ability to prevent and respond to cybersecurity attacks.

In particular, milestone 7-19 consist of the implementation of four concrete actions:
the creation of incident response teams in the French territories;
the deployment of diagnostic and security packs for eligible beneficiaries;
the acquisition of security products for the benefit of the State and public services; and
the increase of the national capacity to detect cyber-attacks.

Milestone 7-19 is the only milestone of this investment.

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence.	Short description
1	Summary document '7-19 Cybersécurité des services de l'Etat_SD_VDEF'	A summary document duly justifying how the milestone was satisfactorily fulfilled, in line with the requirements set out in the CID Annex.
2	Published report 'PJ1_7-19_Rapport d'activité sur le volet cyber du PNRR – Déc. 2024'	A report published by the French cybersecurity agency ('Agence nationale de la sécurité des systèmes d'information': ANSSI) summarising the action taken to duly justify how the milestone was satisfactorily fulfilled, in line with the requirements set out in the CID Annex. Link to file: https://cyber.gouv.fr/sites/default/files/document/Rapport-d-activite-volet-cyber-du-PNRR-Dec-2024.pdf
3	Project list 'PJ2_7-19_Liste des projets_VDEF'	A list summarising projects conducted under the milestone. The list: (i) links each project to one of the four actions, (ii) describes the projects, and (iii) explains how the project increased the level of cybersecurity.
4	Activity reports	Three activity reports ('Rapport annuel parcours de cybersécurité') showing the progress of

	<i>'PJ3_7-19_parcours-cybersecurite-rapport-activite-[YEAR]'</i>	implementation of the deployment of diagnostic and security packs for eligible beneficiaries (for the years 2021, 2022 and 2023).
--	--	---

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the milestone.

The Council Implementing Decision required, in line with the qualitative indicator for the milestone, report to be provided by the French Government providing evidence of completion.

In December 2024, the French cybersecurity agency (*'Agence nationale de la sécurité des systèmes d'information'*: ANSSI) published an activity report on the cyber component of the National Recovery and Resilience Plan on their website: <https://cyber.gouv.fr/sites/default/files/document/Rapport-d-activite-volet-cyber-du-PNRR-Dec-2024.pdf> (evidence 2). This report provides a detailed description on the steps taken to complete all relevant elements of the Council Implementing Decision as described in the following paragraphs.

Completion of the four actions to increase governmental cybersecurity:

creation of incident response teams,

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the following projects shall in particular be implemented: the creation of incident response teams in the territories;**

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, the actions shall **reinforce the ability to prevent and respond to cybersecurity attacks.**

Between May 2022 and July 2024, the ANSSI established 15 incident response teams (evidence 2). Of these, twelve are *'Computer Security Incident Response Teams'* and three are *'Centres de Ressources Cyber ultramarins'*. These incident response teams are operational and have been created in different territories of France.

Furthermore, the creation of these incident response teams reinforces France's ability to prevent and respond to cyber-attacks.

deployment of diagnostic packs,

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the deployment of diagnostic and security packs for eligible beneficiaries;**

The provided evidence (evidence 2) confirms that 945 diagnostic and security packs were deployed at eligible beneficiaries as of October 4, 2024. This number includes both ongoing and completed projects. The ANSSI supervises the projects, while different IT providers deploy the packs and are responsible for the follow-up. The activity reports (evidence 4) provide ample evidence of the process and its implementation.

Furthermore, the packs are made available only for eligible beneficiaries (evidence 2).

acquisition of cybersecurity tools,

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the acquisition of security products for the benefit of the State and public services;**

The provided evidence (evidence 2 and 4) duly confirms the acquisition of security products. The service '*Je clique ou pas*' was purchased from the company 'Glimps' on November 14, 2022. The service allows civil servants to check whether an email attachment contains malicious code. The product is used by more than 200 public entities in France with access limited to French civil servants.

The evidence provided further confirms that a product against '*Typosquatting*' was acquired from the company 'Nameshield' (contract valid until end 2024; new procurement contract in process). '*Typosquatting*' is a malicious method where websites closely resemble original websites to obtain sensitive data from users. The web-address looks similar to the original one, containing only minor differences (typos). 'Nameshield' ensures that these sites are taken down and the French authorities take legal action.

The acquisition of the tools '*Je clique ou pas*' and '*Typosquatting*' helps prevent malicious activities on the governmental servers, thereby benefiting the State and public services.

increase of detection capacity of cyberattacks,

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **increasing the national capacity to detect cyber-attacks.**

The evidence provided (evidence 2) confirms that the national capacity to detect cyber-attacks has been increased. Three actions were taken:

- i) The deployment of software detection probes on ministerial servers.
- ii) The increase in deployment in already existing machines ensuring that the collected data is transferred to ANSSI.
- iii) The automatic blocking of malicious websites on the interministerial network.

The installation of these probes allows the detection of automated attacks on servers (or: EDR – Endpoint Detection Response). These probes collect and send the data to be analysed and evaluated. The data is, among other uses, processed to block the access from the interministerial network to websites with malicious content.

Furthermore, the projects were implemented at the national level.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the investment shall support the strengthening of cybersecurity capabilities for public services;**

The acquisition of security products such as '*Je clique ou pas*' and '*Typosquatting*' strengthens the cybersecurity capabilities of the public service. The automatic blocking of malicious websites on the interministerial network further enhances these capabilities (evidence 2 and 4).

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **encourage the development of a competitive and innovative cybersecurity offer for the benefit of the economy and society**

Deployment of diagnostic and security packs for eligible beneficiaries was conducted using 170 different IT providers thereby helping to create a diverse ecosystem of services. The deployment of

software detection probes on ministerial server also help to create a market for this hardware in France (evidence 2 and 4).

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment:

Satisfactorily fulfilled.

Number and name of the Target: 7-27 Number of students having access to digital training

Related Measure: C7.I10 Digitalisation of public services: developing access to higher education throughout the country thanks to digital

Quantitative Indicator: Number

Baseline: 0

Target: 1400000

Time: Q4 2024

1. Context:

The investment supports the access to online learning for higher education students through the creation of digital and accessible online modules in higher education institutions; digital training of teachers-researchers from universities; the development of nation-wide platforms (virtual classroom, webinar, distance exams, learning management system) as well as projects dedicated to digital services focusing on the students' user experience.

The target requires that 1 400 000 students have access to digital training capacities in the higher education system.

Target 7-27 is the only target of this investment.

Following the completion of this target, in line with the description of the measure in the Council Implementing Decision, the nation-wide platforms [(virtual classroom, webinar, distance exams, learning management system) developed under the measure] will eventually offer all the bachelor's and master's modules. This is a further step of this measure that is not linked to the milestones and targets in the Council Implementing Decision.

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence.	Short description
1	Summary document <i>7-27 SD Numérique dans enseignement sup</i>	Cover note setting out how the constitutive elements of the target were achieved.
2	List of beneficiaries <i>7-27 LB Accès au numérique dans enseignement sup VDEF_v14022025</i>	List of beneficiaries listing higher education establishments, their registered administrative unit (code UAI 'unité administrative immatriculée') and the number of students per establishment.
3	7-27 PJ2 Bilan-action1	Report from the General Direction for Higher Education and Professional Integration (<i>Direction Générale de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de l'Insertion Professionnelle – DGESIP</i>) on the outcomes of the projects financed by the RRF under the call 'Hybridization of higher education

		courses' (<i>Hybridation des formations de l'enseignement supérieur</i>).
4	7-27 PJ3 AAP-action1	Terms of reference of the call for projects 'Hybridization of higher education courses' (<i>'Hybridation des formations de l'enseignement supérieur'</i>) launched by the National Research Agency (<i>'Agence Nationale de la Recherche'</i>), which closed on 6 July 2020.
5	PJ4 250203-PNRR-Action 2-Formation des EC au numérique-Bilan fin de projets	Slides detailing the achievements under the call for application to support the digital training of teachers-researchers from universities.
6	7-27 PJ5 AAC-action2-Universités	Letter from the Director of the General Direction for Higher Education and Labour Market Integration (<i>Direction Générale de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de l'Insertion Professionnelle – DGESIP</i>) to higher education institutions (universities) calling for applications for support to train teachers to use digital tools.
7	7-27 PJ6 AAC-action2-Ecoles PJ10 mail-AAC-école	Letter from the Director of the General Direction for Higher Education and Labour Market Integration (<i>Direction Générale de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de l'Insertion Professionnelle – DGESIP</i>) to higher education institutions (schools) calling for applications for support to train teachers to use digital tools. Transmission email dated 7 June 2021.
8	7-27 PJ7 Cinématique-acces-classes-virtuelles	Links and screenshots detailing the steps to access virtual classes.
9	7-27 PJ8 Bilan-action4	Report on the implementation of the call related to digital services for students.
10	PJ9 AAP-Action4	Terms of reference of the call for project 'Digital services for students' (<i>'Services numériques aux étudiants'</i>).
11	7-27 PJ11 Focus-projet-action4	Annex providing more detailed information on six of the projects aimed at providing digital student services.
12	7-27 PJ14 Courrier-DGESIP	Letter from the General Direction for Higher Education and Labour Market Integration to higher education institutions from 5 April 2023.
13	PJ11 2021.04_MENESRI_Convention d'Objectifs et de Moyens Signée Le 15.04.2021_Plan de Relance	Initial agreement between the Ministry of Higher Education, Research and Innovation and the GIP FUN and its two subsequent addenda setting out the objectives, governance and conditions for

	7-27 PJ15.2 Action 3_Avenant1_Convention_GIP Fun	the development of a digital learning ecosystem.
14	PJ2 250205-PNRR-Action 2-Formation des EC-Descriptions projets Univ Ecoles	List of projects supported for the digital training of teachers-researchers.
15	PJ8 220119_AAP Services Numeriques aux Etudiants_Rapport du jury_VF	Evaluation report for the call for project 'Digital services for students' (<i>'Services numériques aux étudiants'</i>).
16	7-27 PJ12 Guide_d'utilisation_Inscriptions	User guide for the open data SISE database.
17	C7.I10_1.2.6_Action3_Convention_ Université Lille_POD	Signed agreement between the Ministry for Higher Education and Research and Lille University for the development of the POD solution.
18	(a) C7.I10_5.4.3_Action3_Relevé_décisions_COPIl_plateforme_20210315 (b) C7.I10_5.4.3_Action3_Relevé_décisions_COPIl_plateforme_20210715	Steering committee (<i>'COPIl'</i>) reports of action 3 (platforms) from 15 March 2021 and 15 July 2021.
19	Convention-FUN-avignon signee	Signed agreement between France Université Numérique and Avignon University for the development of a dashboards solution
20	Hybridation_Bilan final_HILISIT-VF2-signee	Final report on project HILISIT supported by the call for project 'Hybridization of higher education courses'
21	987_PNRR_listeid	Statistical table listing unique student identifiers (INE) per higher education institution
22	RD GT Examens - 10.2023 VF	Steering committee reports from the working group on distance exams (<i>'GT "Examens a distance"'</i>)
23	communication-nantes	Presentation of the project Boardz (dashboard) at a conference in Nantes in April 2024
24	C7.I10_5.4.3_Action3_COPIl	Report of steering committee meetings on the digital platforms supported under the measure

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the target.

Number of students having access to digital training capacities in the higher education system.

France provided a list of students registered per higher education establishment (evidence 2) for the school year 2022/2023, extracted from the Student Tracking Information System (*'Système d'Information sur le Suivi de l'Etudiant – SISE'*), indicating a total of 1 737 350 students.

The Commission services accessed the link to the open-source and publicly available SISE database provided by the authorities under evidence 1 (<https://data.enseignementsup-recherche.gouv.fr/explore/dataset/fr-esr-sise-effectifs-d-etudiants-inscrits-esr-public/export/?sort=>) to verify that the number of students in the higher education system for the school year 2022-2023 corresponds to the figures provided in evidence 2. France also provided the database user guide (dated 2019-2020, but still in effect) which confirms that '*SISE INSCRIPTIONS lists all registrations taken on January 15 of year N in the various higher education institutions (universities, engineering schools, business schools, major institutions and Catholic institutes). [...] Each registration relates to a student (identified by their INE number), to a diploma prepared (identified by their SISE code) and to a location (identified by their UAI number)*' (evidence 16). When filtering the statistical data to the school year 2022-2023 and looking at the '*Number of registered students (primary registration), excluding students also registered in Preparatory Classes for Grandes Écoles*', the number of students reported under evidence 2 per higher education establishments corresponds to the data shown in the open data SISE database, totalling 1 737 350 students.

France also provided data extracted by Information Systems and Statistical Studies ('*systèmes d'information et études statistiques (SIES)*') which includes students' unique identifiers ('INE'). For data protection purposes, this detailed data is not publicly available online (evidence 21). This data shows a total of 1 707 103 unique National Student Identifier ('*Identifiant National Etudiant*' (hereinafter referred to as *INE*')) entries (students). The small discrepancy (1.74%) with the total reflected in the open-source database is due to the fact that the data was published (online data) and extracted (evidence 21) at different points in time and that INE data is collected at a different time than the initial data.

France also provided a letter dated 5 April 2023 from the Director of the General Direction for Higher Education and Labour Market Integration (*Direction Générale de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de l'Insertion Professionnelle – DGESIP*) to higher education institutions in France (evidence 12), which informs of the launch of a free national service for virtual classes and the distribution of educational content for all higher education institutions, available to all students and teachers of each institution. The list of higher education institutions depending on the Ministry is publicly available under chapter VII of the Education Code ('*Code de l'Éducation*'), for which France provided a link under evidence 1. The Commission services accessed the link provided by the authorities to verify that the institutions listed in evidence 2 are included in chapter VII of the Education Code. This check was completed successfully.

This confirms that the 1 707 103 students registered in higher education in France have access to digital training capacities, exceeding the required target of 1 400 000 students.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the development of remote learning courses and the corresponding infrastructures shall allow adaptation to the current health situation by avoiding overcrowding in lecture halls and classrooms. It shall also pave the way to a longer-term strategy of accessibility to higher education intended to reach a wider public throughout the national territory but also abroad. Moreover, it shall allow proposing a more diverse and complete training offer, suited to the constraints of certain students who have to reconcile their studies with a professional activity.**

The letter from the Director of the General Direction for Higher Education and Labour Market Integration (*Direction Générale de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de l'Insertion Professionnelle – DGESIP*) to higher education institutions in France (evidence 12), explains that the free national service for

virtual classes was necessary due to the rise in online learning, ensuring continuity in the higher education system during health crisis.

The investment allows access to online higher education resources for all students of higher education institutions in France, enabling courses to reach a wider audience (evidence 12). This objective of providing access to diverse profiles, including continuing education for students with a professional activities, is also mentioned in the description of some of the projects supported by the call for project 'Hybridization of higher education courses' (*'Hybridation des formations de l'enseignement supérieur'*) (evidence 4) and described in the brochure of the national symposium on the hybridisation of higher education training held in Paris in January 2023 (link provided under evidence 1, which the Commission services were able to access to verify the project descriptions). For example, project AHFLO aims to provide online training for continuing education; project HybrINSA aims to offer training in IT and mechanics and their mutualization with continuing education; and project PROMETHEE aims to offer a modular training including highly specialized training for companies in the region.

France also shared a link to a conference held in March 2023 by the Distance Learning Inter-University Federation (*'Fédération Interuniversitaire de l'Enseignement à Distance (FIED)'*) on 'students with barriers to learning: is tailor-made accessible to all? Constraints, opportunities and solutions' (*'Publics empêchés : le sur-mesure accessible à tous ? Contraintes, opportunités et solutions'*) in the summary document (link provided under evidence 1, which the Commission services were able to access to verify information related to the conference). The conference aimed to reflect on barriers and options for reaching students with learning constraints such as top athletes, students in prisons, students with a disability, artists, employed students and those in continuing education, and on the '*university of the future*'. Projects were presented to illustrate potential solutions, including those financed by the measure, such as PUNCHy.

Moreover, some projects from the call 'Hybridization of higher education courses' also aim to reach international students, offering access to higher education modules to students abroad. For example, project AHFLO has, as one of its objectives, to capitalize on the experiences developed during the health crisis and accelerate the policy of developing distance learning decided as part of Inalco's long-term digital strategy in order to reach national and international audiences on the teaching of languages and civilisations who cannot follow face-to-face training; project Hybridium Licence Santé aims to constitute a national reference model in terms of hybridization of training with prospects of dissemination in other disciplines and internationally (link to the brochure of the national symposium on the hybridisation of higher education training held in Paris in January 2023 provided under evidence 1, which the Commission services were able to access to verify the project descriptions). Project HILISIT also has an international dimension as it targets students and teachers from French-speaking institutions abroad (pages 1 and 5 of evidence 21).

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the investments shall support projects for: creation of digital and accessible online modules in higher education institutions**

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the investment shall fund the deployment of dematerialized course modules in higher education**

This requirement of the Council Implementing Decision was implemented through a call for projects on the hybridization of higher education programs.

France provided a copy of the terms of reference of the call for projects 'Hybridisation of higher education courses' (*'Hybridation des formations de l'enseignement supérieur'*) (evidence 4), under

which 19 projects were selected for support, financed by C7.110 of the Recovery and Resilience Facility. An additional 15 projects were supported under the French Programme d'Innovation d'Avenir under the same call.

The terms of reference of the call set out the type of expected projects on page 6, with the priority being the creation of educational modules. The report prepared by the General Direction for Higher Education and Labour Market Integration on the outcome of the call (evidence 3) maps, on page 8, the type of actions contributed to by each project, with 13 projects contributing to the creation of online resources.

The 19 projects which benefited from support under the Recovery and Resilience Facility are listed in Annex 1 of the report provided by France on the implementation of the measure setting out the results of the projects funded and implemented under the measure (evidence 3). The Commission services accessed the link provided by the authorities under evidence 1 (<https://www.enseignementsup-recherche.gouv.fr/fr/renforcer-l-hybridation-des-formations-d-enseignement-superieur-47059>) to verify that the list published on the website of the Ministry of Higher Education and Research corresponds to the list provided in evidence 3. This check was completed successfully, confirming that the investment funds the deployment of dematerialized course modules in higher education. Overall, according to the report, 259 institutions (chart 2) and 406 929 students (chart 6) benefited directly from the projects funded. Moreover, 261 online training (page 5) representing 6295 teaching units (chart 4) are freely accessible on the national online platform, and therefore accessible to all higher education students from the list of beneficiaries. France also provided links to publicly accessible training modules produced under the call for Hybridisation of higher education courses (evidence 1). The Commission services were able to access the links to verify the training modules.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the investments shall support projects for: developing of nation-wide platforms (virtual classroom, webinar, distance exams, learning management system) which shall eventually offer all the bachelor's and master's modules**

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the investment shall fund [...] the installation of the necessary digital infrastructure**

This requirement of the Council Implementing Decision was implemented by the Public Interest Group France Digital University (*'Groupement d'Intérêt Public France Université Numérique – GIP FUN'*), the state provider responsible for digital support.

France provided a copy of the signed agreement between the Ministry of Higher Education and Research and the Public Interest Group France Digital University (*'Groupement d'Intérêt Public France Université Numérique – GIP FUN'*) for the development of nationwide online platforms, signed on 15 April 2021 (hereinafter referred to as 'agreement'), as well as an addendum to the agreement signed on 20 October 2022 (evidence 13). Article 3 of the agreement, modified by addendum, sets out the requirements for the platforms and includes, among others a virtual classroom solution; a webinar solution; online best practice guidance for implementing remote exams and knowledge assessment; a learning management dashboards solution; and a scale up of the 'POD' on-demand video system. For the POD solution, France provided a copy of the agreement signed on 17 November 2022 between the Ministry for Higher Education and Research and University of Lille which is the entity implementing the project (evidence 17).

The platforms use open-source tools which means that the solutions are sovereign solutions fully owned by the government with no need for institutions to purchase user licences (evidence 13 and as

explained on the following link: <https://www.enseignementsup-recherche.gouv.fr/fr/des-plateformes-numeriques-pour-l-enseignement-superieur-90254>).

France provided the links and screenshots detailing how students can access the online platform to have access to the **virtual classes and webinars** (evidence 8). The link is also listed in the letter from the General Direction for Higher Education and Labour Market Integration (*Direction Générale de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de l'Insertion Professionnelle – DGESIP*) to higher education institutions in France (evidence 12). During on-the-spot checks by the Commission services conducted on 13 February 2025 and 31 March 2025, the Commission services were able to successfully check that the virtual classroom and webinar solutions are operational and that students can access it through their university credentials. Moreover, the drop-down list to log in to the platform on the home page confirms that all institutions from the list of beneficiaries (evidence 2) have access to the virtual classes and webinar solutions.

The virtual classes and webinars are available to higher education institutions' teachers and therefore allow to cover modules for bachelor and master students.

France provided the reports from the meetings of the working group on distance exams which include the link to an open-source platform providing guidance and best practice on **distance exams** (evidence 22, page 12), aimed at higher education institutions. The platform allows higher education institutions to improve their distance exams practices by benefitting from guidance and shared experiences from other institutions acquired during and since the COVID crisis. The Commission services were able to access the link to verify they are operational and to access the published resources.

France provided the partnership agreement between France Université Numérique and the University of Avignon for the development of the **learning management dashboards** solution ('*tableaux de bord*') signed on 13 December 2022 (evidence 19). France also provided reports of the steering committee meetings that followed the project throughout its implementation (evidence 24) and a presentation of the project and its outcome at a conference in Nantes on 2, 3 and 4 April 2024 (evidence 23). The dashboards solution provides support to both students and teachers to adapt to hybrid learning by highlighting informal information which is lost in distance learning compared to face-to-face learning. The dashboards solution supports learning management, teaching management and the improvement of training courses (evidence 23). It also allows teachers to identify signs of potential student dropouts early on (evidence 23 and 24).

Some of the projects implemented from the call for project 'Hybridization of higher education courses' ('*Hybridation des formations de l'enseignement supérieur*') also include support to equipment and infrastructure for hybrid teaching. For example, the project AgilHybrid included actions for equipment and infrastructure, project AHFLO focused on the strengthening technological infrastructure and digital equipment, as described in the brochure of the national symposium on the hybridisation of higher education training held in Paris in January 2023 (link provided under evidence 1, which the Commission services were able to access to verify descriptions of the projects). Overall, the report '*Bilan Action 1*' on the outcomes of the projects financed by the RRF under the call 'Hybridization of higher education courses' prepared by the Collège des conseillers scientifiques et pédagogiques (CCSP) in July 2024 (evidence 3) demonstrates that 17 of the 19 projects funded provided support for infrastructure and/or equipment for hybrid courses.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the investments shall support projects for digital training of teachers-researchers from universities**

This requirement of the Council Implementing Decision was implemented through a call for interest to higher education institutions.

France provided a copy of the letter of 4 February 2021 from the Director of the General Direction for Higher Education and Labour Market Integration (*Direction Générale de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de l'Insertion Professionnelle – DGESIP*) to higher education institutions (universities) in France (evidence 6), calling for applications to support teachers with the use of digital tools. A similar letter transmitted by email on 7 June 2021 was addressed to highly selective higher education institutions (écoles) in France (evidence 7).

France also provided the list of projects supported under the call (evidence 14) as well as the report prepared by General Direction for Higher Education and Labour Market Integration (*Direction Générale de l'Enseignement Supérieur et de l'Insertion Professionnelle – DGESIP*) from July 2024 (evidence 5) which confirm that 90 projects were selected, of which 76 were implemented, representing 19 952 trained teachers. The report details the type of actions taken by universities, which included the recruitment of an educational engineer, peer training, and training from external contractors. Outputs of the call also included the production of online materials for teachers by 68 institutions and the equipment of material enabling hybrid teaching in ten institutions.

France explained that in the context of the call for applications, the terms 'teachers' and 'teachers-researchers' were used interchangeably given the emphasis on the teaching element. Therefore, by default, the call for applications was open to both teachers and teachers-researchers. This is confirmed in evidence 14 which provides a short description of the projects implemented under the call, where projects refer to both 'teachers' and 'teachers-researchers'.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the investments shall support a call for projects dedicated to digital services focusing on the students' user experience.**

This requirement of the Council Implementing Decision was implemented through a call for projects.

The terms of reference of the call for projects 'digital services for students' (*'services numériques aux étudiants'*) aim to support projects to facilitate students' lives by providing digital services in various areas such as administrative procedures, campus life, community life, health, housing, catering, culture, and digital services offered by the regions to students (page 1 of evidence 10).

France provided the evaluation committee's report for the 'digital services for students' project call (evidence 15), which outlines the evaluation committee members, the call's requirements and the evaluation committee decisions for each project. This report also includes a description of the projects assessed. Additionally, the General Direction for Higher Education and Labour Market Integration prepared a report 'outcome of the implementation of the call for projects 'Digital services for students' (*'Bilan de l'appel à projets "Services numériques aux étudiants"'*) (evidence 9), in June 2024. Evidence 9 includes an annex with the list of the 20 selected projects, together with a brief description (page 4).

France also provided a document with more detailed information on six flagship projects implemented under the call (evidence 11), including a project related to administrative procedures for international mobility, which was made available to all higher education institutions (project SMILE). Evidence 11 also includes an active link to the digital service portal for each project. The Commission services were able to access these links to verify the portals.

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment: Satisfactorily fulfilled

Number and name of the Milestone: 7-31 Schemes to support art creation.

Related Measure: C7.I11 Support for cultural sectors and heritage renovations

Qualitative Indicator: Report to be provided by the French Government providing evidence of completion.

Time: Q4 2024

1. Context:

The measure supports cultural sectors through investments in heritage renovations and employment and training modernization. The investment in artistic employment and training modernization shall support three actions: an 'ecological transition fund' that finances projects in favour of ecological and digital transition carried out by artistic creation institutions (labels and venues for live performance and visual arts); and an exceptional public order program to give new impetus to creation in all disciplines. The second program aims to support young designers in particular. It is thus a one-off expenditure in favour of supporting the creation of works of art, all disciplines combined. The third action, which will be covered by the Milestone 7-30 in the context of the fifth instalment, consists of a modernization plan for cultural higher education establishments which shall invest in energy retrofitting, support training, and strengthen their digitalization through the modernization of their teaching tools and their IT infrastructures.

Milestone 7-31 concerns the completion of the two above mentioned schemes.

Milestone 7-31 is the first step of the implementation of the investment and will be followed by target 7-28 and milestone 7-29, related to the renovation of cultural heritage and target 7-30 related to the renovation of art and architecture schools.

The investment has a final expected date of implementation on 30 June 2026.

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence.	Short description
1	Summary Document 'PJ1_7-31_Summary document_VDEF'	A summary document duly justifying how the milestone was satisfactorily fulfilled in line with the requirements set out in the Council Implementing Decision Annex.
2	Report of the French Government 'PJ1_7-31_Rapport du gouvernement.pdf'	Published report on 25 October 2024 by the French Government (French Ministry of Culture) titled 'Dispositifs de soutien à la création artistique' provides evidence of completion. Also available under the following link: Mesure du plan national de relance et de résilience (PNRR) :

		dispositifs de soutien à la création artistique
3	List of beneficiaries 'PJ2_7-31_Listedebénéficiaires.VDEF.xlsx'	This list includes all beneficiaries of the two schemes put in place under this measure. It covers — the names of the projects/artists; the geographical location of the projects; — the amounts of the projects; — a brief description of the projects.
4	Call for interest under the 'Mondes nouveaux' scheme. 'PJ3_7-31_AMI Mondes Nouveaux.pdf'	Call for expressions of interest launched from 28 June 2021 to 22 August 2021 to support artists. Also available under the following link: Mesure du plan national de relance et de résilience (PNRR) : dispositifs de soutien à la création artistique
5	Press release for 'Mondes nouveaux' scheme. 'PJ4_7-31_Dossier de presse_Mondes nouveaux_08112021.pdf'	Press release issued by the French Ministry of Culture on 8 November 2021 after the closure of the selection process.
6	Web site dedicated to 'Mondes Nouveaux' scheme	Web site of the French Ministry of Culture reflecting the creation et the design of the projects. Also available under the following link: Mondes nouveaux
7	DGCA strategic note to the attention of prefects and DRAC services. 'PJ6_7-31_Note stratégique 20102020_DRAC.pdf'	This note of the 'Direction Générale de la création artistique' of the Ministry for Culture (DGAC) dated 6 October 2020 was notified to prefects et regional directorates for the cultural actions (DRAC) and consisted of the eligibility conditions for the 'Fonds de transition écologique' projects.

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the milestone.

The Council Implementing Decision required, in line with the qualitative indicator for the milestone, a report to be provided by the French Government providing evidence of completion

Completion of the two schemes to support institutions focusing on art creation and support artists through a public programme for supporting the creation of works of art.

The French authorities have provided a report titled 'Dispositifs de soutien à la création artistique' provides evidence of completion (evidence 2) issued on 25 October 2024 by the General Directorate for Art Creation (DGCA) in the French Ministry of Culture that evidences the completion of the two schemes to support institutions focusing on art creation and support artists through a public programme for supporting the creation of works of art. The report has been drafted as a winding-up certification of the completion of the two schemes where among the description of the purpose and

the beneficiaries of both schemes, it describes all the steps of the implementation of the funds (planification, publication of the calls for interest and for proposals, selection phase, monitoring and closure steps). The report has been prepared and issued through the collaboration of the services responsible for the implementation of the schemes and the internal control services responsible for the assurance of the use of adequate internal procedures for these schemes' implementation (pages 17 to 18 of evidence 2).

In addition, the report, along with supporting documentation (press release and dedicated web site: evidence 5 and 6), certifies that the funds reached their targeted beneficiaries. It also contains pictures that evidence the realization of the funded projects (pages 33 to 107 of evidence 2).

The report was published on 25 October 2024 and is available under the following website of the Ministry of Culture : [Mesure du plan national de relance et de résilience \(PNRR\) : dispositifs de soutien à la création art Dispositifs de soutien à la création artistique](#). The Commission services accessed the link provided by the authorities on 20 February 2025 to verify that the document published corresponded to the one transmitted as evidence. This check was completed successfully, confirming that the corresponding evidence has been made public.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the investment for artistic employment and training modernization shall support [...] actions: an 'ecological transition fund' that finances projects in favour of ecological and digital transition carried out by artistic creation institutions (labels and venues for live performance and visual arts;**

With an initial allocation of EUR 20 million, as evidenced in the 'Direction Générale de la création artistique strategic' note to the attention of prefects and Regional Directorates for Cultural Affairs (DRAC), services (evidence 7), the Ecological Transition Fund (hereinafter referred to as FTE) co-financed as a matter of priority investment projects:

- i) that were to be carried out over a short period of time (usually two years) by labelled and subsidised institutions in the region in the field of the live performance and visual arts.
- ii) such as:
 - a. retrofitting work to standards and energy performance;
 - b. thermal renovation to limit energy consumption;
 - c. buildings whose building qualities and materials provide them with strong sustainability;
 - d. projects directly related to the environment – water management— biodiversity;
 - e. investments in the digital transition of entertainment rooms and visual arts exhibition venues;
 - f. technical and scenario equipment to modernize the institutions' common equipment, with a view to sustainable development and better energy performance.

The funds for this scheme have been delegated to the Regional Directorates for Cultural Affairs (DRAC), designated as responsible for steering and monitoring this fund. The projects were pre-selected by the DRAC in consultation with the local authorities concerned. The DGCA ensured a territorial balance between regions and a balanced distribution of resources between structures (small and large).

The envelope was distributed between the different DRAC after examination of the files proposed by the latter. The DRACs were responsible for monitoring the projects which were subject to the payment of investment grants.

214 projects were carried out for 226 projects initially selected under the Fund. Some projects have been postponed or abandoned because of difficulties encountered by the managers (mainly local and regional authorities) due to the scarcity of certain materials or an overrun of initial costs due to inflation caused by the war in Ukraine.

Fund's appropriations were allocated and paid only to projects selected and carried out.

The report (evidence 2), the DGCA strategic note to the attention of prefects and DRAC services (evidence 7) and the list of beneficiaries (evidence 3) evidence the completion of the fund by detailing the programming, the implementation and the closure of the Ecological Transition Fund.

In addition, a specific section of the report drafted by the internal control department of the DGCA describes that the scheme has been implemented in the respect of the financial interest of the EU and that the Funds files have been initiated and paid in accordance with the applicable procedures adopted for the decentralized administration.

The review of the of above-mentioned evidence confirms that requirement for the satisfactory completion of the Fund scheme is met.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **an exceptional public order program to give new impetus to creation in all disciplines. This program aims to support young designers in particular. It is thus a one-off expenditure in favor of supporting the creation of works of art, all disciplines combined.**

With an allocation of EUR 30 million, the 'Monde Nouveaux' fund consisted in one-off expenditure (evidence 4 and 5) for the creation of works in all disciplines (live performance, visual arts, design, writing) and especially for young creators, particularly affected by the COVID crisis.

A call for expressions of interest (AMI) was launched with a period of application submission from 28 June to 22 August 2021 (evidence 4). This AMI proposed the following actions:

- i) a tailor-made coaching by an artistic committee.
- ii) a research grant allowing artists to dedicate themselves to the realisation their work.
- iii) a production budget that was aligned to the particularity of each proposal.

Almost 3200 projects were submitted, covering most of the fields of the contemporary creation: visual arts, music, writing, live performance, design and applied arts.

Applications were examined by an artistic committee composed of 9 experts from different artistic and geographical backgrounds. The projects were selected based on several criteria, among others, special attention was paid to young people and the diversity of disciplines:

After a consultation process and based on the quality of each project, 264 projects were selected based on their suitability with the provisions of the call for expressions of interest and the ability of artists to produce them.

From the 264 selected projects, a total of 259 productions were produced under the programme.

Of the EUR 30 million under the 'Nouveaux Mondes' programme, 92 % of the budget has been mobilized for creators, including EUR 1.63 million for research allocations artists and EUR 25.8 million for the realization of the projects, with project budgets ranging from EUR 3200 to EUR 171230.

Each stage of implementation of the programme resulted in a public communication:

- i) Publication of the call for expressions of interest in June 2021 on the website internet of the Ministry of Culture (press release of 22 June 2021) (evidence 4).
- ii) A press briefing was carried out on 8 November 2021 at the end of the process of selection, to present the projects of the 264 selected artists (evidence 5).
- iii) A dedicated website fully documents the creation process and the design of each project. It reports on the implementation and presentation of finished projects (evidence 6).

The report (evidence 2), the call for interest under the 'Mondes nouveaux' scheme (evidence 4), the press release for 'Mondes nouveaux' scheme (evidence 5), web site dedicated to 'Mondes Nouveaux' scheme (evidence 6) and the list of beneficiaries (evidence 3) evidence the completion of the fund by detailing the programming, the implementation and the closure of the 'Mondes Nouveaux' programme.

In addition, a specific section of the report drafted by the internal control department of the DGCA describes that the scheme has been implemented in the respect of the financial interest of the EU and that the 'Monde nouveaux' funding files have been initiated and paid in accordance with the applicable procedures adopted for the decentralized administration.

The review of the of above-mentioned evidence confirms the requirement for the satisfactory completion of the 'Mondes Nouveaux' scheme is met.

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment: Satisfactorily fulfilled

Number and name of the Target: 9-4 State digital infrastructure in the field of health

Related Measure: C9.I1 Digital health

Quantitative Indicator: Number (in million)

Baseline: 9.5

Target: 40

Time: Q4 2024

1. Context:

The objective of investment C9.I1 Digital health is to accelerate the development of digital tools in the health sector. It consists of four sub-measures:

- it shall accelerate the deployment of State information systems: the shared medical record, the digital health platform, one-stop shop for all digital services for healthcare professionals, electronic identification cards for healthcare professionals.
- it aims at upgrading the existing software already used in the public and private sector to make them compatible with the interoperability and security requirements imposed by the State.
- it shall finance the deployment of software, support users and provide financial support to incentivise healthcare professionals to use digital services, in particular the shared medical record.
- it aims at equipping long term care facilities with digital infrastructure such as internet connection, computers and software.

Target 9-4 concerns the number of patients having a national electronic health record and a secured health email address.

Target 9-4 is the first step of the implementation of the investment and relates to the first sub-measure – deployment of the State information system. It is followed by target 9-5, related to the interoperability and security of installed fleet software and support and incentives for its use and target 9-6, related to the digital catch-up of social medicine.

The investment has a final expected date for implementation in Q4 2024.

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence	Short description
1	T9-4 summary document 'SD - 9-4 Mon espace santé'	A summary document duly justifying how the target was satisfactorily fulfilled in line with the requirements set out in the Council Implementing Decision Annex.
2	List of départements 'PJ1_9-4_ListeBénéficiaires'	List of 107 departments or sub-sets of departments (i.e. French administrative territorial units 'départements') indicating the number of people registered in the French social security system having a dedicated space on the Digital Health Platform ('Espace

		<i>numérique de Santé’ / "Mon Espace Santé").</i>
3	Guide of the notification campaign <i>‘PJ2_9-4 Mon espace santé_LR-DDGOS-15-2022-ANNEXE 1 - BOOK CAMPAGNE DE NOTIFICATION’</i>	This guide describes the notification campaign launched to inform people registered in the French social security system of the creation of their dedicated space on the Digital Health Platform.
4	Timeline for the scaling-up of the ‘Mon espace santé’ programme <i>PJ3_9-4 Mon espace santé_LR-DDGOS-15-2022-ANNEXE 2 - planning envois généralisation</i>	This document presents the timeline of the mailings to people registered in the French social security system to inform them about the scaling up of the Digital Health Platform programme.
5	E-mail template used for the notification campaign <i>‘PJ4_9-4 Mon espace santé_LR-DDGOS-15-2022-ANNEXE 7 MAIL D’INFORMATION’</i>	This document is the template of the e-mails sent to people registered in the French social security system to inform them about the creation of their dedicated space on the Digital Health Platform, effective at the end of a six weeks opt-out period.
6	Justification of the baseline, internal document <i>‘PJ5_9-4_Mon espace santé_Etat DMP 31 juin 2021’</i>	This internal document presents the aggregate number of dedicated spaces on the Digital Health Platform already created in June 2021 (baseline year).
7	Justification of the baseline, information report No. 3231 of the National Assembly of 22 July 2020 on the shared medical record and health data <i>‘PJ6_9-4 Mon espace santé_Rapport-parlement information_DMP’</i>	This document is a Parliamentary report dated July 2020 on the deployment of the national electronic health record or ‘Shared Medical Record’ (<i>‘dossier médical partagé’</i>).
8	Justification of the baseline, report of the French Court of Auditors <i>‘PJ7_9-4_Mon espace santé_RapportCourdesComptes_MES’</i>	This document is a report dated May 2024 of the French Court of Auditors on the deployment of the Digital Health Platform programme.
9	Justification of the deployment –infographic presentation published on 03 October 2024 <i>‘PJ8_9-4_Mon espace santé_Infographie MES septembre 2024’</i>	This document published on 03 October 2024 presents the data on the take-up of the dedicated space on the Digital Health Platform.
10	Justification of the deployment: screen shot of the monitoring tool <i>‘PJ9_9-4 Mon espace santé_Déploiement national à juin 2024’</i>	This screenshot of the Knowage database shows the share of people registered in the French social security system having a dedicated space on the Digital Health Platform created in each department or sub-set of department at the end of June 2024.
11	Justification of the deployment, press release <i>‘PJ10_9-4 Mon espace santé_Communi qué presse 2024 atteinte 15 millions’</i>	This press release dated 7 October 2024 by the Ministry of Health contains information on the number of dedicated spaces created and activated on the Digital Health Platform. https://www.ameli.fr/paris/assure/actualites/mon-espace-sante-15-millions-d-

		assures-ont-deja-active-leur-carnet-de-sante-numerique
12	Justification of the reliability of the monitoring tools - 'RNIAM' dashboard 'PJ11_9-4 RNIAM_PIO8_USAGE_14-Specification_Evolutions_RNIAM_EPIC-16670'	This document presents the technical specifications of the social security register 'RNIAM' ('répertoire national inter-régimes de l'Assurance maladie') dashboard used to monitor the Digital Health Platform programme.
13	Justification of the reliability of the monitoring tools – tests applied to Knowage 'PJ12_9-4 RNIAM_PIO8_USAGE_14-Tests_RNIAM_description'	This document presents the technical specifications of the tests applied to the Knowage tool used to monitor the Digital Health Platform programme.
14	Justification of the reliability of the monitoring tools – tests applied to Knowage 'PJ13_9-4 Business Process Test with Component Steps and Component Details Set Usage 14'	This document presents the description of the tests applied to the Knowage tool used to monitor the Digital Health Platform programme.
15	Justification of the reliability of the monitoring tools – tests applied to Knowage 'PJ14_9-4 Test Set Usage 14 CR exec tests RNIAM_PIO8_USAGE_14-Tests_description'	This document presents the results of the tests applied to the Knowage tool used to monitor the Digital Health Platform programme.
16	Justification of the reliability of the list of beneficiaries – screenshot for one 'département' 'PJ15_9-4 Extract Knowage_departement01'	This document is a screenshot of the monitoring system showing the result of a request for one department; it displays the number of people registered in the French social security system having a dedicated space on the Digital Health Platform in a department.
17	Justification of the reliability of the list of beneficiaries – screenshot for several 'départements' 'PJ16_9-4 Extract Knowage_multidépartements'	This document is a screenshot of the monitoring system showing the result of a request for one department; it displays the number of people registered in the French social security system having dedicated space on the Digital Health Platform in a department. in each department.
18	Law establishing the digital health platform 'espace numérique en santé'	Articles L1111-13-1 of the on the Public Health Code defines the characteristics of the 'digital health platform' ('espace numérique en santé' / 'mon espace santé') Link: https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/article_lc/LEGIARTI000042644871
19	Justification of the deployment of the digital health platform 'Mon Espace Santé' Les chiffres clés du déploiement du Ségur du numérique en santé Agence du Numérique en Santé	Key figures on the usage of the Digital Health Platform by patients and health care professionals.
20	Justification of the deployment of the one-stop-shop doctrine 2023 page-a-page vf.pdf	Document providing an overview and the state of play of the regulatory framework and of all technical solutions

		deployed to build the digital health services (<i>'Doctrine du numérique en santé'</i>).
21	Justification of the deployment of the one-stop-shop Solutions candidates et référencées Ségur Agence du Numérique en Santé	Online database listing all software solutions used by health care professionals and establishments and certified to provide access to the digital health platform (one-stop-shop). The list includes the descriptions of the type of services accessible via each certified software.
22	Justification of the deployment of the one-stop-shop https://esante.gouv.fr/espace-presse/retour-sur-le-segur-du-numerique-en-sante-vague-1	Press release from 22/09/2022 indicating the number of software solutions certified to provide access to the digital health platform (one-stop-shop).
23	Justification of the deployment of the electronic identity cards for health care professionals Link to Pro Santé Connect Portail Industriels	Link to the tool used by health care professionals to verify their identity and have a secure access to the digital health platform using their electronic identification card (<i>'carte CPS or app e-CPS'</i>).
24	Justification of the deployment of the electronic identity cards for health care professionals <i>'9-4 avancement carte identité électronique.ppt'</i>	Statistical report of 15 February 2025 provided by Pro Santé Connect on the deployment of the electronic identification cards for healthcare professionals (app version).
25	8 extracts from the SI-CPS tool <i>'9-4 - ddmmyyy ANS - TdB national des cartes actives'</i>	8 screenshots from the SI-CPS tool showing the increase in the number of electronic identification cards (version with chips).
26	Extract on the spot from the Knowage information system mirroring the list of beneficiaries <i>'9-4 - Contrôle_Systeme_Knowage_20250224'</i>	List of 107 departments or sub-sets of departments indicating the number of people registered in the French social security system having a dedicated space on the Digital Health Platform.
27	Extract on the spot from SIPil information system <i>'9-4 - Contrôle système SI PIL au 24 février 2025_Extraction données'</i>	Extract from the SIPil information system showing a daily time series of the number of shared medical records (<i>'Dossier médical partagé'</i>) between September 2021 and November 2024.
28	Press release of 3 November 2022 2022-11-03-DP-MES-bilan-déploiement-national-prochaines-etapes.pdf	Presse release of 3 November 2022 providing a state of play of the deployment of the Digital Health Platform.
29	Décret n° 2021-1048 du 4 août 2021 relatif à la mise en œuvre de l'espace numérique de santé https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/jorf/id/JORFTEXT000043914270	Decree No. 2021-1048 of 4 August 2021 on the implementation of the Digital Health Platform describing the process

		to create the dedicated space on the Digital Health platform.
30	Délibération n° 2021-051 du 15 avril 2021 portant avis sur un projet de décret relatif à la mise en œuvre de l'espace numérique de santé https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/jorf/id/JORFTEXT_000043914692	Positive opinion of the CNIL (Commission Nationale Informatique et Liberté) on the process to create the dedicated space on the Digital Health Platform.

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the target.

Number of patients having a national electronic health record and a secured health email address.

France provided a list of 107 departments or sub-sets of departments (i.e. French administrative territorial units '*départements*') indicating the number of people registered in the French social security system having a dedicated space on the Digital Health Platform ('*Espace numérique de Santé*' / also called "*Mon Espace Santé*") (evidence 2). According to this list, by November 2024, 60 499 313 people registered in the French general social security system had a dedicated space on the digital health platform. This meant that they had a national electronic health record / shared medical record ('*dossier médical partagé*') and a secured health email address, as provided by Article L1111-13-1 of the Public Health Code: Section 3: Digital Health Platform, shared medical record and pharmaceutical record (thereinafter referred to as 'Article L1111-13-1 of the Public Health Code') (evidence 18).

This list is an extract from the Knowage information system used to monitor the implementation of the digital health platform. Given the strict medical confidentiality protecting the personal records stored in the digital health platform, France provided evidence of the reliability and robustness of the information system Knowage used to produce the aggregate numbers presented in the list of 'departments' (evidence 2). France provided a description of the technical specifications of the information system (evidence 12 and 13), the tests applied to Knowage (evidence 14) and the results of these tests (evidence 15). France also provided screenshots of the data extracted from Knowage for a single department as well as for several departments (evidence 16 and 17), to be compared with the relevant data in the list of departments (evidence 2).

The Commission services conducted an on-the-spot check on 24 February 2025 to verify the reliability of the data extracted from the Knowage information system. The check consisted of prompting the Knowage information system on-the-spot to obtain the total number of people having a dedicated space on the digital health platform. This exhaustive check was completed successfully, confirming that more than 60 million (60 901 114) people registered in the French general social security system have a dedicated space on the digital health platform 'Mon Espace Santé', well above the 40 million target.

According to the provisions of Article L1111-13-1 of the Public Health Code (evidence 18), a dedicated space on the digital health platform '*Espace numérique de santé*' is open by default for all individuals, unless the person explicitly opposes it. Article L1111-13-1 of the Public Health Code (evidence 18) also specifies that the dedicated space on the digital health platform '*Espace numérique de santé*' notably

provides access to the national electronic health record (*'dossier médical partagé'*) and to a secured health email address (*'messagerie de santé sécurisée'*).

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the investment shall accelerate the deployment of State information systems: the shared medical record**

France provided evidence that the investment has accelerated the deployment of State information systems. The number of open *'Espace numérique de santé'* increased from 9.3 million on 9 June 2020, as noted on page 45 of the information report No. 3231 of the National Assembly of 22 July 2020 on the shared medical record and health data (evidence 7), to 10.1 million at the end of 2021 as noted on page 339 of the 2024 Court of Auditors report of 29 May 2024 on social security, in chapter ten on the deployment of the *« Mon Espace Santé »* programme (evidence 8). This information confirms the baseline figure 9.5 million mentioned in the Council Implementing Decision, based on the data available at the time the French Resilience and Recovery Plan was negotiated (end 2020) extracted from the SI-PILOTAGE DMP information system used to monitor the deployment of the national electronic health record (*'Dossier médical partagé'*). The number of open *'Espace numérique de santé'* national electronic health record / shared medical records then increased at a faster pace reaching 60 499 313 million in November 2024 (evidence 2).

The Commission services conducted an on-the-spot check on 24 February 2025 to verify the reliability of the data extracted from the SI-PILOTAGE DMP information system used to monitor the deployment of the national electronic health record / shared medical record. The check involved prompting the SI-PILOTAGE DMP information system on-the-spot to reproduce a chart showing the number of active shared medical records by day between September 2021 and end October 2024. This check was completed successfully, confirming the sharp increase in the number of shared medical records created from 15 million in May 2022 to 65 million in July 2022, hence the acceleration in the deployment of the shared medical record (DMP – *'Dossier médical partagé'*).

The Commission services conducted an on-the-spot check on 27 February 2025, to verify the proper functioning of several features of the State digital infrastructure in the field of health, including the shared medical record, the digital health platform, the one-stop shop for all digital services for health care professionals and the electronic identification cards for health care professionals. During the visit to the hospital, the Commission staff confirmed that a health care professional connected securely to the shared medical record of patient X, and that once connected, the health care professional was able to consult the patient's 'shared medical record', and to send patient X a message using 'a secured health email address'. The Commission Staff also confirmed that Patient X could connect to her shared medical record and consult the message sent by the health care professional.

This rapid deployment was facilitated by a general notification campaign between January and May 2022 informing (by email or by post) all individuals registered in the French social security system (RNIAM register *répertoire national inter-régimes de l'Assurance maladie*) of the automatic opening of their dedicated space on the digital health platform Espace numérique de santé, as foreseen by Articles R. 1111-28 to 30 of Decree No. 2021-1048 of 4 August 2021 on the implementation of the Digital Health Platform (evidence 29). The notification opened a six-week transition period during which individuals could opt out from the system, after which the dedicated space on the Digital Health Platform was automatically created. French authorities clarified that the dedicated space on the Digital Health Platform was not created for individuals that could not be reached (evidence of e-mail or post not being delivered) (evidence 29 and 30). The social security register (RNIAM) is synchronised

daily with the central National Register (*RNIPP - répertoire national d'identification des personnes physiques*) to ensure accuracy and avoid double counting.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the digital health platform**

The number of documents uploaded by health care professionals on the digital health platform '*Mon espace santé*' increased from less than 10 million per year in 2021 to more 350 million in 2024 according to the online dashboard presenting the key figures on the usage of the Digital Health Platform by individuals and health care professionals on the website of the Ministry of Health / Digital Health Agency (evidence 19). This increase, also verified in the context of target 9-5, attests of the acceleration of the deployment of the digital health platform.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **one-stop shop for all digital services for healthcare professionals**

The one-stop-shop consolidates access to key digital services (digital prescription, verification of patient identity, consultation of health insurance records, sick leave certificates, etc.) used by health care professionals on one web portal (Web BSP / Ameli Pro) and ensures compatibility of this web portal with the software solutions used by health care professionals. The steps underpinning the deployment of the one-stop-shop are described in the overview of the regulatory framework and of technical solutions deployed to build the digital health services (*Doctrine du numérique en santé 2023*) (evidence 20). The list of all software solutions used by health care professionals and establishments and certified to provide access to the digital health platform is available online (evidence 21). It shows that at the time of the payment request there are 259 certified software solutions, compared to 126 in September 2022 (evidence 22), attesting to the acceleration in the deployment of the one-stop-shop. For each certified software, the list specifies the type of health care institution using the software and the descriptions of the services accessible.

During the on-the-spot check of 27 February mentioned above, the Commission staff confirmed that while connected to the certified operating system of the hospital (LIFEN), the health care professional could access a full range of digital services. Those included issuing medical reports, signing them and sharing them with the patient, a secure mail service to communicate with patients and other health care professionals, within and outside the hospital, etc.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure **electronic identification cards for healthcare professionals**.

Information extracted from the information system used to monitor the electronic identification cards (SI-CPS), the total number of identification cards for health care professionals (*CPS - Carte de Professionnel de Santé*) increased from 807 674 in October 2021 to 920 776 in January 2025 (evidence 25). In addition, according to the statistical report of 15 February 2025 provided by Pro Santé Connect, the number of electronic identification cards (e-CPS app version) activated by healthcare professionals have increased significantly from 100 000 in March 2021 to 450 000 in November 2024 (evidence 24). During the assessment period, the Commission accessed the link provided by the French authorities to the tool used by health care professionals to verify their identity and have secure access to the digital health platform using their electronic identification card (carte CPS or app e-CPS) (evidence 23). During the on-the-spot check of 27 February mentioned above, the Commission staff confirmed that

a health care professional connected to the shared medical record of patient X using her electronic identification card (e-CPS).

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment: Satisfactorily fulfilled

Number and name of the Target: 9-5 Finalisation of interoperability and security of installed fleet software and support and incentives for its use

Related Measure: C9.I1 Digital health

Quantitative Indicator: Number (in million)

Baseline: 3

Target: 15

Time: Q4 2024

1. Context:

The objective of investment C9.I1 Digital health is to accelerate the development of digital tools in the health sector. It consists of four sub-measures:

- it shall accelerate the deployment of State information systems: the shared medical record, the digital health platform, one-stop shop for all digital services for healthcare professionals, electronic identification cards for healthcare professionals.
- it aims at upgrading the existing software already used in the public and private sector to make them compatible with the interoperability and security requirements imposed by the State.
- it shall finance the deployment of software, support users and provide financial support to incentivise healthcare professionals to use digital services, in particular, the shared medical record.
- it aims at equipping long term care facilities with digital infrastructure such as internet connection, computers and software.

This target 9-5 is linked to the second sub-measure focused on the interoperability and safety of the software used by the public and private healthcare sectors [and the third sub-measure focussed on supporting and incentivising healthcare professionals in the digital transition].

Target 9-5 requires that 15 000 000 digital documents are prepared by healthcare professional (such as biology reports, radiology reports, hospital reports and certificates) and saved in the new system in total. Given the baseline number of 3 000 000, the additional documents required amount to at least 12 000 000.

Target 9-5 is the second target of the investment.

Target 9-5 is accompanied by target 9-4, related to the State digital infrastructure in the field of health and target 9-6, related to the digital catch-up of social medicine in this payment request. The investment has a final expected date for implementation in Q4 2024.

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence.	Short description
1	T9-5 summary document <i>'9-5 SD Numérique en santé Interopérabilité'</i>	A summary document duly justifying how the target was satisfactorily fulfilled in line with the requirements set out in the Council Implementing Decision Annex

2	Law No. 2019-774 of 24 July 2019 relating to the organization and transformation of the healthcare system (https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/jorf/id/JORFARTI000038821329)	Its Chapter II sets out the modalities for providing each user with a digital health space ' <i>espace numérique en santé</i> ' (Articles 44 to 52) (within Title III Developing digital ambition in healthcare (Articles 41 to 55)) and amending or inserting the relevant articles of the Public Health Code (including L. 1110-4-1, L. 1110-4-2, L. 1111-13, L. 1111-13-1, L. 1111-13-2, 1111-14 and L. 1111-15)
3	The relevant Article of the Public Health Code as amended by Law No. 2019-774 of 24 July 2019 and in force as after 1 January 2022: https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/codes/article_lc/L_EGIARTI000042644871/2022-06-13	Article L1111-13-1 of the Public Health Code defines the characteristics of the 'digital health platform' (' <i>espace numérique en santé</i> ' / ' <i>mon espace santé</i> ')
4	Report of the French Court of Auditors submitted for target 9-4: <i>'PJ7_9-4_Mon espace santé_Rapport CourdesComptes_MES'</i>	In the beginning of the report, it is explained in detail with relevant legal references how the system of the shared medical record was relaunched in France in a revamped form, called the digital health space and known to the public as My Health Space
5	Digital health Website (' <i>e-santé</i> ')	A link to the website on digital health (' <i>e-santé</i> '), specifically the part of the website indicating the key figures of the deployment of the digital health Ségur (' <i>Ségur du numérique en santé</i> ') and including the number of documents added to (My Health Space – ' <i>Mon espace santé</i> ', MES) by type over 'last month' (at the time of verification, the last month corresponding to January 2025). Link: https://esante.gouv.fr/segur/transparence
6	List of health care establishments ' <i>9-5 PJ1_Liste des bénéficiaires MES VDEF</i> '	List of 21 public or private healthcare establishments, indicating the number of documents sent to the new system (MES) by those establishments since January 2022 (also indicating the number of documents by their type for each establishment)
7	21 Extracts from the information system ' <i>9-5 PJ3 n°X preuve [healthcare establishment name]</i> '	21 extracts from the SI-PILOTAGE DMP (Shared Medical Record, ' <i>Dossier médical partagé</i> '), a tracking system by National Health Insurance Fund (' <i>Caisse nationale de l'assurance maladie</i> ', CNAM), presenting, by establishment

		and by document type, the number of documents prepared and registered by healthcare professionals in the new system (My Health Space – ‘ <i>Mon espace santé</i> ’)
8	Justification of the baseline, extract of the information system predating the new system referred to in the target <i>‘9-5 PJ2_Mon espace santé_justificatif documents’</i>	This extract presents the aggregate number of 3 093 024 (= 5 360 103 – 2 267 079) documents fed by healthcare professionals and establishments in the Shared Medical Record (‘ <i>Dossier médical partagé</i> ’, former system) for the year 2019 (5 360 103 documents added include 2 267 079 added by patients themselves, which need to be deducted to arrive at the number of documents added by healthcare professionals)
9	Integration Guide DMP <i>‘9-5 PJ4_Guide intégration DMPi v2.9.1’</i>	Technical documentation describing the technical specifications to be followed by software editors to interact with MES
10	Decree No. 2016-995 of 20 July 2016, related to liaison letters	
11	Qualitative assessment of candidacies and achievement of SUN-ES targets <i>‘9-5 PJ8_SUN-ES-Bilan-CopilSegurNumerique-2024-09-13’</i>	The powerpoint presentation dated 13 September 2024 and presented at the September 2024 Ségur digital COPIL
12	Ministry of Health’s website describing the SUN-ES programme https://sante.gouv.fr/systeme-de-sante/segur-de-la-sante/sun-es	Ministry of Health's website describing the SUN-ES programme and including links to the instructions given to ARS for its implementation (two of the instructions are also provided below under evidence 14 and 15)
13	Powerpoint on financing programme for equipment – SONS, ‘ <i>Système Ouvert et Non Sélectif</i> ’. https://esante.gouv.fr/sites/default/files/media_entity/documents/20210916---webinaire-ans---16-septembre--sons.pdf	The powerpoint presentation dated 16 September 2021, presented on ANS (the French National Agency for Digital Health) webinars, concerning financing programme for equipment – SONS, ‘ <i>Système Ouvert et Non Sélectif</i> ’.
14	Instruction No. DGOS/PF5/DNS/CTO/2021/167 of 26 July 2021 of the Minister of Solidarity and Health to Directors of the Regional Health Agencies (for implementation) and Directors of the Healthcare Establishments (for implementation), regarding the operational launch of lump-sum funding for achieving usage targets in healthcare establishments as part of the digital component of the ‘Ségur de la santé’ initiative	
15	Instruction No. DGOS/PF5/DNS/2022/84 of 29 March 2022 of the Minister of Solidarity and Health to General Directors of the Regional Health	

	Agencies, regarding the bonus for populating the Shared Medical Record	
16	A summary file with dates, medical and medico-social sectors, SONS codes, date of the initial order, links to the government gazette of the French Republic, dates and links to the modifying orders to the government gazette of the French Republic	
17	Justification of the deployment of the one-stop-shop https://esante.gouv.fr/segur/solutions	Online database listing all software solutions used by health care professionals and establishments and certified to provide access to the digital health platform (one-stop-shop). The list includes the descriptions of the type of services accessible via each certified software.
18	Screenshot of Hospital Rothschild information system '9-5 Rothschild-PJ1-Statistiques de l'ES sur PFI'	Screenshot taken during the on-the-spot check of 27 February 2025 from the hospital's information system showing the number of documents uploaded by the hospital's health care professionals into the system in October 2024.

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the target.

Digital documents prepared by healthcare professional (such as biology reports, radiology reports, hospital reports and certificates) and saved in the new system.

The new system was created by Law No. 2019-774 of 24 July 2019, Title III thereof, including Chapter II: Providing each user with a digital health space (Articles 44 to 52) (evidence 2). The new system sets up a dedicated space on the digital health platform '*Espace numérique de santé*' (also called My Health Space, '*Mon espace Santé*'), for the wider public, hereinafter referred to as 'MES/DMP'). In particular, according to Article L1111-13-1 of the Public Health Code: Section 3: Digital Health Platform, shared medical record and pharmaceutical record (evidence 3), the dedicated space on the digital health platform includes a national electronic health record ('*dossier médical partagé*') and a secure health messaging system allowing insured individuals to receive messages from healthcare professionals. Evidence of these features are also presented in the assessment of target 9-4 in this payment request, as well as in a contextual description of the change of the system in the report of the Court of Auditors of 29 May 2024 on social security, in particular Section I/A on pages 338-341 (evidence 4).

According to the summary document, from 1 January 2022 to 30 June 2024, more than 327 million documents were fed into the new MES/DMP system by healthcare professionals. The order of magnitude of the number of uploaded documents by the healthcare professionals since the beginning of 2021 is corroborated by graphs and data published on a dedicated website (evidence 5). According to the website on digital health ('*e-santé*') accessed on 12 February 2025 and on 11 March 2025, biology reports alone saved in the new system in January 2025 would amount to 14 891 414 documents. The data is presented in a graph on different types of medical documents added to

MES/DMP (category '*CR d'examens biologiques*'), thus exceeding the target of an additional 12 000 000 (on top of a baseline of 3 000 000) digital documents prepared by healthcare professionals and saved in the system.

The French authorities also provided a list of 21 selected public or private healthcare establishments, indicating the number of documents added by them to the 'new system' in the chosen reference period (from 1 January 2022 to 30 June 2024), totalling 28 393 181 documents (evidence 6). The list was supplemented by 21 extracts from the SI-PILOTAGE DMP (DMP standing for Shared Medical Record, '*Dossier médical partagé*'), a tracking system by the National Health Insurance Fund ('*Caisse nationale de l'assurance maladie*', CNAM). For each of those establishments, the extract shows the number of documents prepared and registered by them in the new system, detailing the numbers by type of document (evidence 7). No discrepancies between the beneficiary list and the extracts of the information system were identified.

The types of documents in evidence 6 and 7 include: biology reports (labelled in French '*CR d'examens biologiques*' or '*CR d'anatomie et de cytologie pathologiques*') for a total number of 10 167 939; radiology reports ('*CR d'imagerie médicale*') for a total number of 2 765 872; and hospital reports and certificates ('*CR opératoire*', '*CR hospitalier (séjour)*', '*CR d'admission*', '*CR de passage aux urgences*', '*CR d'accouchement*') for a total number of 1 987 040. The list includes also other types of documents prepared by healthcare professionals, which are also covered by the target.

The Council Implementing Decision required, in line with the name of the target, the **finalisation of interoperability and security of installed fleet software and support and incentive to its use.**

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **this investment shall prioritise technological investment to promote the exchange of health data such as hospital release documents, biology reports, radiology reports and images, prescription and liaison letters.**

The national electronic health record allows health care professionals to upload health related documents in the patient's MES/DMP. The goal is to enable, with the patient's consent, sharing of the patient's documents between all professionals who are likely to take care of them through a secured access to MES/DMP (pages 12 to 13 and 15 of evidence 9).

The types of documents in evidence 6 and 7 include: hospital release documents ('*Lettre de sortie*'), biology reports ('*CR d'examens biologiques*' and '*CR d'anatomie et de cytologie pathologiques*'), radiology reports and images ('*CR d'imagerie médicale*'), prescription ('*Prescription*') and liaison letters ('*Lettre de sortie*'). The latter corresponds to liaison letters emanating from healthcare establishments given the scope of the evidence 6 and 7 (the subcategories of liaison letters and modalities of their transmission are set out in evidence 10).

The Commission services conducted an on-the-spot check on 27 February 2025, to verify the proper functioning of several features of the State digital infrastructure in the field of health, including the shared medical record, the digital health platform, the one-stop shop for all digital services for health care professionals and the electronic identification cards for health care professionals. During the visit to the hospital, the Commission staff confirmed that documents containing health data are uploaded in a secure format by the system to the patient's shared medical record automatically, once signed by the health care professional, and if and only if the patient's identity has been 'qualified', i.e. cross-checked. This is only possible because the operating system of the hospital is one of the certified

software solutions (LIFEN) compatible with the interoperability and security requirements imposed by the State, which are also detailed in evidence 9 (see sections 3.2, 3.3, 3.4 and 3.5 thereof). The list of certified software solutions is available online (evidence 17).

The Commission staff confirmed that the technical staff prompted the hospital's information system based on the certified LIFEN software to display the number of documents uploaded in the digital health platform (MES) by health care professionals employed by the hospital. The screen displayed the information for the month of October 2024 and by type of documents, including hospital release documents, biology reports, radiology reports and images, prescription and liaison letters. A screenshot of the information displayed during the visit was also sent to the Commission services as evidence (evidence 18).

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **this investment shall finance the deployment of software and support users.**

Financing the deployment of software and supporting users was ensured through SONS '*Système Ouvert et Non Sélectif*' (State procurement mechanism for healthcare providers, indicated in page 3 of evidence 10 as being part of 'new financial measures' for 'software application'. The programme is also presented in further detail under evidence 13, which includes links to its principal documents such as calls for funding, applicable requirements and orders as of 16 September 2021 (on page 32). The programme included a call launched on 11 August 2021 for Radiology and a series of calls, launched on 13 August 2021: for Computerized Patient Record, for Identity Reference, for Interoperability Platform, for Medical Biology and Private Practice Physicians.

For hospitals, for instance, the support of users, namely healthcare professionals within hospitals, is ensured through functionalities including:

- Managing the necessary and useful information for patient care and follow-up, as well as the traceability of care and actions taken;
- Facilitating the production of medical documents (see slide 13 of evidence 13).

Links to all relevant orders of the programme, grouped by sector, that is for private practice physicians, radiology, biology, hospitals, pharmacies, operators of the development and publishing of information systems and digital services and tools in healthcare, medico-social sector, medical images , as published in the government gazette of the French Republic can also be found on pages 1 to 2 of evidence 16.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **it shall also provide financial support to incentivise healthcare professionals to use digital services, in particular the shared medical record.**

The financial support to incentivise healthcare professionals to use digital services was provided through the SUN-ES (digital health usage Ségur in healthcare establishments '*Ségur Usage Numérique en Établissements de Santé*') programme. This programme allocated most of the financing to promoting the use of the shared medical record (per initial allocation, EUR 158 million, supplemented with EUR 8.5 million), while EUR 52 million were allocated to promoting the use of a secure health messaging system (evidence 11 and 12, and page 9 of evidence 14 and page 3 of evidence 15). The programme was launched with Instruction No. DGOS/PF5/DNS/CTO/2021/167 of 26 July 2021 of the Minister of Solidarity and Health to Directors of the Regional Health Agencies (for implementation) and Directors of the Healthcare Establishments (for implementation), regarding the operational

launch of lump-sum funding for achieving usage targets in healthcare establishments as part of the digital component of the '*Ségur de la santé*' initiative (evidence 14). It was further complemented with Instruction No. DGOS/PF5/DNS/2022/84 of 29 March 2022 of the Minister of Solidarity and Health to General Directors of the Regional Health Agencies, regarding the bonus for populating the Shared Medical Record (evidence 15).

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment: Satisfactorily fulfilled.

Number and name of the Target: 9-6 Digital catch-up of the social medicine

Related Measure: C9.I1 Digital health

Quantitative Indicator: Number

Baseline: 0

Target: 410000

Time: Q4 2024

1. Context:

The objective of investment C9.I1 Digital health is to accelerate the development of digital tools in the health sector. It consists of four sub-measures:

- it shall accelerate the deployment of State information systems: the shared medical record, the digital health platform, one-stop shop for all digital services for healthcare professionals, electronic identification cards for healthcare professionals.
- it aims at upgrading the existing software already used in the public and private sector to make them compatible with the interoperability and security requirements imposed by the State.
- it shall finance the deployment of software, support users and provide financial support to incentivise healthcare professionals to use digital services, in particular the shared medical record.
- it aims at equipping long term care facilities with digital infrastructure such as internet connection, computers and software.

Target 9-6 concerns the number of active electronic medico-social records. A medico-social record allows the digitalisation and centralisation of health, social, and administrative data.

Target 9-6 is the third target step of the implementation of the investment and relates to the fourth sub-measure. It is accompanied by target 9-4, related to the State digital infrastructure in the field of health and target 9-5, related to the finalisation of interoperability and security of installed fleet software and support and incentivise healthcare in this payment request. The investment has a final expected date for implementation in Q4/2024.

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence	Short description
1	Summary document 'SD - 9-6 Numérique en santé VDEF 2'	A summary document duly justifying how the target was satisfactorily fulfilled, in line with the requirements set out in the CID Annex.
2	Beneficiary list '9-6_PJ1_Liste des bénéficiaires VDEF 2'	A file containing the beneficiary list with the following columns: <ul style="list-style-type: none">- Geographical FINESS ('Fichier national des établissements sanitaires et sociaux') reference number of the long-term care facility (unique identifier). The FINESS constitutes the reference

		<p>number of structures and equipment in the health, medico-social, social, and training sectors for these professions.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Business name of the long-term care facility - Number of active medico-social records declared at facility level (target) - GALIS project number. The GALIS portal allows healthcare and social services to submit digital applications for funding and subsidies, which are then reviewed by regional health authorities. - Funder: regional health authority, which is responsible for the funding ('agence régionale de santé (ARS)') - SIRET number of the project holder. THE SIRET (Establishment Directory Identification System) is a unique and essential number for any business in France. It makes it possible to identify each establishment of a company, including self-employed people. - Business name of the project holder
3	<p>72 calls for projects for the 18 regions in France for 2021 - 2024</p> <p>'9-6 PJ11 ESMS num AAP - [region's abbreviation] [YEAR]</p>	<p>Calls for projects in all 18 French regions, outlining in detail the funding conditions set by regional health authorities. The calls cover the years 2021-2024.</p>
4	<p>60 official extracts from the information system</p> <p>'9-6_échantillon1_Preuve_ [sample number]_[FINESS number]_[Galis number]'</p>	<p>The official extracts from the information systems of 60 long-term care facilities sampled showing the number of active medico-social records (target) per facility.</p>
5	<p>14 descriptions of the used IT systems</p> <p>'9-6_échantillon1_SpecEditeur_[Name IT system]'</p>	<p>Technical explanations of the used IT systems of the 60 facilities sampled. The descriptions explain how the data shown in the extracts relate to the measure description. Further, they provide information on the aggregation of records (target) inside the database of a facility.</p>

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the target.

410 000 active electronic medico-social records

As the records themselves are protected by strict medical secrecy, the achievement of the target was verified by sampling at the long-term care facility level.

The French authorities provided a list containing 4 703 long-term care facilities with a total of 441 625 active medico-social records exceeding the target of 410 000 records (evidence 2). The list allowed to identify a long-term care facility through its unique identifier or '*FINESS géographique*'.

Following the selection of a random sample of 60 long-term care facilities from the 4 703 facilities, France submitted official extracts from the information systems of the beneficiary facilities (evidence 4), proving that the number of active records by facility corresponds to the number reported to the national authorities (evidence 2). In addition, France submitted the descriptions of the IT systems used by the sampled 60 long-term care facilities. These descriptions (evidence 5) demonstrated on a horizontal level that the shown value of active records in the official extracts from the information systems (evidence 4) corresponds to the definition of an 'active record' meaning that the record:

- i) exists in the application,
- ii) is linked to a person, and
- iii) was updated in the last three month (or system allows to filter for any period).

Furthermore, the description of the IT systems showed the aggregation from a single record to the overall sum per facility (evidence 5).

The evidence provided for a sample of 59 units (evidence 4) confirmed that the requirement of the target has been met. The number of records per facility corresponded or exceeded the number reported in the beneficiary list in these 59 facilities for which the requirements has been met (evidence 2 and 4).

A statistical analysis was carried out taking into account the overachievement of the target of 441 652 for a required 410 000 records. Based on this, there is statistical assurance that the target has been met, and all its constitutive elements have been satisfactorily fulfilled.

The Commission services conducted three on-the-spot checks on 21 March 2025 to verify that the number of records in three long-term care facilities corresponded to the values reported in the official extracts from the information systems (evidence 4). These checks were completed successfully, confirming that the mentioned records existed in these facilities.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **professionals of one or several regions shall invest jointly to lower the cost and ensure coherence.**

The Council Implementing Decision required that professionals of one or several regions shall invest jointly to lower the cost and ensure coherence. Professionals, which are long-term care facilities, were only strongly encouraged by the national health authorities to invest in groups of 15 (or eight in the case of Corsica or the overseas departments) facilities to receive funding to buy the software to create, among others, records (evidence 3). However, a long-term care facility which could organise the investment itself was not excluded from receiving funding (evidence 3). Long-term care facilities could

reach the threshold either by being part of an organisation consisting of a sufficient number of facilities or by organising among each other in groups. These groups (or '*grappes*') organised under a sponsor or '*porteur de projet*' (evidence 3). Organising in groups increases coherence and increasing the number of customers decreases costs.

Whilst this constitutes a minimal substantive deviation from the requirement of the Council Implementing Decision, 99.89% of long-term facilities invested jointly meaning that only 0.11% or 5 out of 4 703 facilities invested alone according to the beneficiary list (evidence 2). The GALIS project number was used as indicator for joint investments. When one or multiple long-term care facilities request a grant, they use the GALIS application which links a GALIS project number to the request. This number allows to identify joint investments as long-term care facilities in the same project share a GALIS project number. It further allows to identify long-term care facilities which invested alone as they have a unique GALIS number (evidence 2 and 3).

As of this, this minimal deviation does not change the nature of the measure and does not affect the progress towards achieving the investment that the target represents. On this basis, it is considered that this constitutive element of the target is satisfactorily fulfilled.

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment: Satisfactorily fulfilled.

Number and name of the Target: 9-8 Number of investment projects in the construction, energy renovation or modernization of medical establishments (> € 20 million) (cumulative)

Related Measure: C9.I2 Modernisation and restructuring of hospitals and health care supply

Quantitative Indicator: Number

Baseline: 0

Target: 10

Time: Q4 2024

1. Context:

The objective of investment C9.I2 Modernisation and restructuring of hospitals and health care supply is to contribute to the improvement of French Health infrastructure. As announced in the Health Segur plan, the government has committed to increasing investment support for hospitals and health care facilities.

Target 9-8 concerns the number of investment projects in the construction, energy renovation or modernisation of medical establishments, validated by the ARS (Regional Health Agency) for an amount exceeding EUR 20 000 000. Cumulative calculation.

Target 9-8 is the second target of the investment, and it follows the completion of target 9-7 related to establishments supported in their investments in technical installations, equipment or light renovation. It will be followed by target 9-10 and target 9-9, related to the second step of targets 9-7 and 9-8 respectively.

The investment has a final expected date for implementation in Q2 2026.

2. Evidence provided:

	Name of the evidence.	Short description
1	Summary document	Summary document justifying how the milestone was satisfactorily fulfilled.
2	List of recipients	List of recipients with the 13 projects provided by French authorities n° 2021/13 of 30 July 2021.
3	Information note of 31 July 2021	Information note addressed from Ministry of Health and Solidarity to Regional Health Agencies (ARS).
4	Official Notification 1 of 23 February 2023	Official notification of subsidies of Regional Health Agencies (ARS) to CH Paul Ardier.
5	Contractual commitment 1 signed on 22 September 2023	Contractual commitment for project 1 between ARS and Hospital.
6	Regional Strategy for investment 1 of 15 October 2021	Regional Strategy for investment for Auvergne-Rhone-Alpes (2021-2029).

7	Addendum to the multiannual contract 2 signed on 13 November 2023	Addendum to the multiannual contract for project 2 between ARS and Centre for Social guidance -DIVIO.
8	Regional Strategy for investment 2	Regional Strategy for investment for Bourgogne-Franche-Comté.
9	Addendum to the multiannual contract 3 signed on 11 October 2023	Contractual commitment for project 3 between ARS and Hospital.
10	Regional Strategy for investment 3	Regional Strategy for investment for Bourgogne-Franche-Comté.
11	Addendum to the multiannual contract 4 signed on 20 November 2023	Contractual commitment for project 4 between ARS and Hospital.
12	Official Notification 4 & 5 of 11 October 2023	Official notification of subsidies of Regional Health Agencies (ARS) to CH Brest.
13	Regional Strategy for investment 4	Regional Strategy for investment for Bretagne.
14	Addendum to the multiannual contract 5 signed on 20 November 2023	Contractual commitment for project 5 between ARS and Hospital.
15	Regional Strategy for investment 5	Regional Strategy for investment for Bretagne.
16	Addendum to the multiannual contract 6 signed on 27 February 2024	Contractual commitment for project 6 between ARS and Hospital.
17	Official Notification 6 of 24 January 2024	Official notification of subsidies of Regional Health Agencies (ARS) to CH Guillaume Régnier.
18	Regional Strategy for investment 6	Regional Strategy for investment for Bretagne.
19	Addendum to the multiannual contract 7 signed on 23 August 2023	Contractual commitment for project 7 between ARS and the Health Cooperation Grouping (GCS).
20	Official Notification 7 of 17 October 2022	Official notification of subsidies of Regional Health Agencies (ARS) to Henriville suite care center.
21	Regional Strategy for investment 7	Regional Strategy for investment for Hauts-de-France (2021-2030).
22	Addendum to the multiannual contract 8 signed on 16 November 2023	Contractual commitment for project 8 between ARS and Oscar Lambret Center.
23	Official Notification 8 of 5 Mai 2023	Official notification of subsidies of Regional Health Agencies (ARS) to Oscar Lambret Center.
24	Regional Strategy for investment 8	Regional Strategy for investment for Hauts-de-France (2021-2030).
25	Official Notification 9 of 25 September 2023	Official notification of subsidies of Regional Health Agencies (ARS) to Hospital of Paris.
26	Contractual commitment 9 signed on 5 December 2023	Contractual commitment for project 9 between ARS and Hospital.

27	Regional Strategy for investment 9	Regional Strategy for investment for Ile-de-France (2021-2030).
28	Addendum to the multiannual contract 10 signed on 9 November 2023	Contractual commitment for project 10 between ARS and Hospital.
29	Regional Strategy for investment 10	Regional Strategy for investment for Normandie (2021-2030).
30	Addendum to the multiannual contract 11 signed on 4 July 2023	Contractual commitment for project 11 between ARS and Hospital.
31	Regional Strategy for investment 11	Regional Strategy for investment for Normandie (2021-2030).
32	Addendum to the multiannual contract 12 signed on 29 Mars 2024	Contractual commitment for project 12 between ARS and Hospital.
33	Regional Strategy for investment 12	Regional Strategy for investment for Occitanie of 15 October 2021.
34	Addendum to the multiannual contract 13 signed on 29 Mars 2024	Contractual commitment for project 13 between ARS and Hospital.
35	Regional Strategy for investment 13	Regional Strategy for investment for Occitanie of 15 October 2021.
36	Official Notification 12 &13 corrigenda of 16 February 2023	Official notification of subsidies of Regional Health Agencies (ARS) to CHU Nîmes.

3. Analysis:

The justification and substantiating evidence provided by the French authorities cover all constitutive elements of the target.

Number of investment projects in the construction, energy renovation or modernisation of medical establishments, validated by the Regional Health Agency (ARS) for an amount exceeding EUR 20 000 000. Cumulative calculation.

The evidence provided by the French authorities confirms that there are more than ten projects. The list of beneficiaries submitted (evidence 2) includes 13 projects related to the construction, energy renovation, or modernisation of health facilities, validated by the Regional Agency of Health (ARS) each with a total amount exceeding EUR 20 million. Regarding the check of the projects total amount. The addendum to the multiannual contract, the contractual commitment or notification letter (evidence 5, 7, 9, 11, 14, 16, 19, 22, 26, 28, 30, 32 and 34) confirm the total financing amount for each project which exceeds EUR 20 million.

The addendum to the multiannual contract or the contractual commitment, signed by the Regional Health Agency (ARS) and the beneficiary medical establishment, confirms that each project has been validated by the Regional Health Agency (ARS) (evidence 6, 8, 10, 13, 15, 18, 21, 24, 27, 29, 31, 33 and 35). The subsidies for each project came from the Health SEGUR plan subsidies usually distributed as the Health Modernisation and Investment Fund (FMIS) of the National Recovery and Resilience Plan. The Health Modernisation and Investment Fund (FMIS) subsidies were sometimes complemented by national subsidies allocated through Article 50 of Law n°202-1576 of 14 December 2020 of financing of social national security for 2021.

In addition, the list of beneficiaries (evidence 2) indicates whether the project concerns the construction, energy renovation, or modernisation of medical establishments. This can be verified with the addendum to the multiannual contract, contractual commitment or the notification letter (evidence 4, 5, 7, 9, 11, 12, 14, 16, 17, 19, 20, 22, 23, 25, 26, 28, 30, 32, 34 and 36) proving that each project corresponds at least to one of these categories.

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **a part of these investments concerns the complete renovation and the modernisation of hospital buildings, also with a view to increasing their energy efficiency (improved insulation of buildings to improve thermal comfort, better performance of technical installations reducing consumption). Other investment projects concern the construction of outpatient facilities and the modernisation of medical infrastructure and equipment (such as the equipment of surgical rooms and the development of outpatient services).**

The addendum to the multiannual contract or the contractual commitment (evidence 5, 7, 9, 11, 14, 16, 19, 22, 28, 30, 32 and 34) explains the nature of subsidies, aligning with the Regional Health Agency (ARS) strategy proving that the investment projects cover the types of action mentioned in the measure description. Each Regional Health Agency follows the Information Note of 30 July 2021, identifying the broad outlines of investment policy in the territories (evidence 3).

Furthermore, in line with the description of the measure, **the Regional Health Agencies shall be responsible for identifying and examining the investment needs of hospitals with regard to the specific needs of their territories.**

The Regional Health Agency (ARS) provided their regional investment strategy for each project (evidence 6, 8, 10, 13, 15, 18, 21, 24, 27, 29, 31, 33 and 35), which outlines the investment needs identified, including the priority projects for the region, and explains the trajectory for granting the aid.

4. Commission Preliminary Assessment: Satisfactorily fulfilled.